

### Public Accounts Committee Records of Meetings

Year: 2021

The following records of meetings have been approved by the Committee.
Signed
Deputy Inna Gardiner
Chair Public Accounts Committee

### **Record of Meeting**

### Meeting held by video conference

Date: 18th January 2021

Present	Deputy Inna Gardiner (Chair) Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone (Vice-Chair) Connétable John Le Maistre Connétable Richard Vibert
	Dr Helen Miles HM
	Mr Adrian Lane AL
	Mr Graeme Phipps GP
In attendance	Senator Tracey Vallois
	Caro Tomlinson, Committee and Panel Officer
	Theo Stone, Research and Project Officer
	Lynn Pamment, Comptroller and Auditor General, C&AG
	Catherine Madden, Chief of Staff (Item 4 only)
	Kevin Hemmings, Head of Financial Governance (Item 4 only)
	Mike Thomas, Director of Risk and Audit (Item 4 only)

Agenda matter	Action
1. Minutes	
The Committee approved the private and public minutes of 5th and 19th October 16th and 30th November, and 7th December 2020.	
2. Declaration of Interests	
Deputy Gardiner declared an interest in work relating to the Future Hospital on account of her membership of the Future Hospital Review Panel and agreed to remove herself from any work relating to it.	
Dr Miles declared an interest through her membership of the advisory panel for the Citizen's Jury on Assisted Dying.	
3. PAC Membership	
Deputy Gardiner confirmed to the Committee that Senator Tracey Vallois had asked to join the Panel, and that she would be officially appointed at the States Assembly's Meeting on Tuesday 18th January 2021 – subject to States Approval.	
Deputy Gardiner confirmed that Paul van Bodegom, an architect, would be invited to join the Panel as a lay member, following the 14 days' notice to the States Assembly required under Standing Order 124 and its approval on Tuesday 8th February 2021.	
On noting the previous work of the PAC, Mr Phipps recommended that the PAC recruit a number of 'specialists' to help advise the Committee when undertaking	

certain Reviews. Deputy Gardiner noted that procedures were in place, but the Committee would need to know who they would want to join for which specific areas.

#### 4. PAC Sub-Groups

The Committee received a paper outlining the proposed membership of its three sub-groups, which would each review a key area of work.

These would consist of the following:

- Performance Management: Chair (lead), Mr Adrian Lane, Dr Helen Miles, and Mr Graeme Phipps;
- Covid Response (including Procurement and Financial Management):
   Chair, the Constable of St Martin, and the Constable of Grouville; and
- Estate Management: Chair, Mr Graeme Phipps, the Constable of St Peter.

### 5. Private Briefing from Chief of Staff on Use of the Recommendations Tracker

The Committee welcomed the Chief of Staff and Officers to a private briefing on the Government of Jersey's use of its Recommendations Tracker.

This briefing was held in private in accordance with the Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011 (as amended) under Qualified Exemption Article 35.

#### 6. Comptroller and Auditor General Thinkpiece on Public Audit in Jersey

The Committee received a presentation from the C&AG on their thinkpiece on public audit in Jersey. The Committee agreed to publish a press release outlining its response to the thinkpiece, and to defer the C&AG's presentation on Anti-Corruption Arrangements to the next meeting.

#### 7. PAC Review of Performance

The Committee received a draft copy of the Terms of Reference and Scrutiny Document for its planned review of Performance and agreed to discuss it further at its next meeting, with the planned sub-group on Performance providing steer.

The Committee received answers from the Director General for Justice and Home Affairs on questions submitted to the DG in December 2020. HM expressed concern about the lack of detail in some of the responses and noted a lack of clear evidence in certain answers. It was agreed to resume work on this area once the review and sub-group have bene officially launched.

The Committee also answers to follow-up questions submitted to the Chief Executive following his Quarterly Hearing with the Panel. The Constable of St Martin noted concerns about a lack of clear answers.

CT, TS

### 8. PAC Teamworking

The Panel received a working paper outlining proposed sub-groups for PAC and its respective membership. The Committee agreed to discuss this in greater detail during its Away Day on Thursday 28th January 2021.

CT, TS

#### 9. R.4/2021 - Lease of Broad Street

The Committee noted that the proposed 25-year lease of Broad Street had been withdrawn and agreed to ask questions about the proposed lease in its upcoming quarterly hearing with the Chief Executive. The Committee further noted that the Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel had agreed to take the lead on this subject and would provide scrutiny where they saw fit.

10. Estate Management	
The Committee received correspondence from the Director of Jersey Property Holdings and the Director General for Infrastructure, Housing and the Environment.	
11. Citizens Panels	
The Panel noted that a draft letter had been prepared, asking the Chief Executive to provide details on the use and design of Citizens Panels.	
12. Questions for the Quarterly Public Hearing with the Chief Executive, 1	
February 2021	
The Committee received a draft question plan for its upcoming Quarterly Hearing with the Chief Executive and agreed to consider it at its next meeting.	CT, TS
13. Work Programme	,
The Committee received and approved a draft copy of its Work Programme for 2021.	
14. Next Meeting	
The Committee noted that its next meeting would be held on Thursday 28th 2021 at 11am at St Martin's Public Hall.	

### **Record of Meeting**

### Meeting held by video conference

Date: 28th January 2021

Present	Deputy Inna Gardiner (Chair) Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone (Vice-Chair) Senator Tracey Vallois Connétable John Le Maistre Connétable Richard Vibert
	Dr Helen Miles Mr Adrian Lane Mr Graeme Phipps
In attendance	Caro Tomlinson, Committee and Panel Officer Theo Stone, Research and Project Officer Lynn Pamment, Comptroller and Auditor General, C&AG
	Tracey Turmel (Item 1 only) Paul van Bodegom

Agenda matter	Action
1. Fresh Start Workshop	
The Committee attended a virtual Fresh Start workshop with Tracey Turmel of People Performance Consulting to improve its teamworking and communication skills. It also formed subgroups to draft terms of reference and scope its planned reviews for 2021, namely Performance Management, Covid-19 Response and Estate Management (follow-up).	
This workshop was held in private in accordance with the Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011 (as amended) under Qualified Exemption Article 35.	
2. Conflicts of Interest	
The Chair advised the Committee that the Minister for the Environment had raised concerns about the nomination of Paul van Bodegom as a lay member of the Committee due to potential conflicts of interest. The Chair told the Committee she had reassured the Minister by advising of the Committee's duty to declare potential conflicts of interest, and that as an architect, Mr van Bodegom would not be involved in areas where he would have direct interest, such as the planning of land disposals in the ongoing Estate Management review.	
3. Question Plan for Quarterly Hearing with the Chief Executive	
The Committee recalled that its Quarterly Hearing with the Chief Executive had been postponed to Monday 8th February 2021 because a States sitting had been requisitioned for Monday 1st February.	
The Committee considered and amended a draft question plan and agreed to circulate it prior to the public hearing.	

#### 4. Sub-Groups

The Committee formed three sub-groups, each responsible for the scope of its three planned reviews for 2021, namely Estate Management, Performance Management, and the Executive's response to the COVID-19 Pandemic. The Committee agreed to await the C&AG's first report on the Covid-19 response before commencing its review on the matter. The Committee noted that draft Terms of Reference and Scoping Documents for the outlined reviews would be circulated in due course.

#### 5. Any Other Business

The Committee noted an invitation to attend a virtual Lecture Series on Anti-Corruption Practices in Parliament.

#### 6. Next Meeting

The Committee noted that its next meeting would be held on Monday 8th 2021 at 1pm in private and would include a public hearing with the Chief Executive at 2pm.

### **Record of Meeting**

### Meeting held by video conference

Date: 8th February 2021

Present	Deputy Inna Gardiner (Chair) Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone (Vice-Chair) Senator Tracey Vallois Connétable John Le Maistre (Items 1-3 only) Connétable Richard Vibert
	Dr Helen Miles
	Mr Adrian Lane
	Mr Graeme Phipps
In attendance	Caro Tomlinson, Committee and Panel Officer
	Theo Stone, Research and Project Officer
	Lynn Pamment, Comptroller and Auditor General, C&AG

Agenda matter	Action
1. Minutes	
The Committee approved the private minutes of 18th January and public minutes of 28th January 2021, subject to an update of the recorded Conflict of Interests concerning lay member Paul van Bodegom. The Committee agreed that although he would be involved in the Estate Management Review, he would withdraw from areas of that review where a direct conflict of interest arose.	
2. Question Plan for Quarterly Hearing with the Chief Executive	
The Committee approved an amended question plan for its Quarterly Hearing with the Chief Executive.	
3. Quarterly Hearing with the Chief Executive	
The Committee welcomed the Chief Executive and Chief of Staff to a public hearing by videoconference. It noted the hearing would be streamed live to the public and a transcript provided.	
Following the public hearing, the Committee agreed to write to the Chief Executive and submit a series of additional questions to follow up on issues raised during the hearing. The Committee further agreed to arrange a private, introductory meeting with the incoming interim Chief Executive to discuss with him the Committee's work	
and remit.  4. Anti-Corruption Arrangements	CT, TS
4. Anti-Corruption Arrangements	
The Committee received a presentation on the Comptroller and Auditor General's report on Anti-Corruption Arrangements. The Committee agreed to wait for the Executive Response to be published before providing public-facing comments on the report, and further agreed to monitor whether the report's recommendations were added to the Recommendations Tracker.	

The C&AG confirmed that further work on breaches and exemptions would continue during her work on COVID-19, with a focus on due diligence and a tightening-up of work on conflicts of interest.

The Committee noted an invitation from the Chair to attend a virtual Lecture Series on Anti-Corruption Practices in Parliament and how jurisdictions compare with each other, hosted by McGill University.

#### 5. Review of Performance Management

The Committee approved the Terms of Reference and Scoping Document, subject to minor rewording of the Terms of Reference.

The Committee agreed that the Performance Management Sub-Group should discuss whether to request to attend Executive meetings on performance management and methodology.

The Committee noted the upcoming review's crossover with previous reports of the C&AG, her upcoming work on the Governance of Health and Community Services, and the use of the Recommendations Tracker. It agreed that it would take care not to duplicate her fieldwork and to co-ordinate its review with her work programme.

#### 6. Recommendations Tracker

The Committee noted an update of recommendations contained within the Recommendations Tracker, provided by the Executive's Chief of Staff on Monday 18th January 2021. It agreed each Sub-Group should identify key recommendations corresponding to their respective reviews.

#### 7. Citizens' Panels

The Committee noted a letter dated 2 February 2021 from the Chief Executive regarding the establishment and operation of Citizens' Panels and agreed to discuss it further at its following meeting.

#### 8. Estate Management Review

The Committee agreed to request a private briefing from Infrastructure, Housing & Environment before any public hearing on the Estate Management Strategy.

### CT, TS

### 9. PAC Reviews

The Committee agreed to organise meetings for the Performance Management and Estate Management Sub-Groups to discuss its respective work programmes, with dates to be scheduled. The Committee, having noted that it was to undertake three reviews in the next year, albeit with staggered commencement and end dates, agreed that it should compose a question plan for each Director General's public hearing which incorporated questions on Performance Management, Estate Management and their department's Covid-19 Response. Each Sub-Group of the PAC would be responsible for the first draft of questions relating to their review.

#### 10. Next Meeting

The Committee noted that its next meeting would be held on Monday 8th February 2021 at 1pm and would incorporate a public hearing with the Chief Executive at 2pm.

### **Record of Meeting**

### Meeting held by video conference

Date: 22nd February 2021

Present	Deputy Inna Gardiner (Chair) Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone (Vice-Chair) Senator Tracey Vallois Connétable John Le Maistre Connétable Richard Vibert
	Dr Helen Miles
	Mr Adrian Lane
	Mr Graeme Phipps
	Mr Paul van Bodegom
In attendance	Caro Tomlinson, Committee and Panel Officer
	Theo Stone, Research and Project Officer
	Lynn Pamment, Comptroller and Auditor General, C&AG
	Item 5 Only:
	Tom Walker, Director General for Policy, Planning and Performance Andrew Metcalfe, Head of Strategic Planning and Accountability lan Cope, Interim Director of Analytics and Statistics Kevin Hemmings, Head of Financial Governance

Agenda matter	Action
1. Minutes	
The Committee approved the minutes of 8th February 2021.	
2. Question Plan for Quarterly Hearing with the Chief Executive	
Paul van Bodegom declared an interest in certain areas of Estate Management and that he would withdraw from areas of the review where such conflicts emerged. Senator Vallois declared an interest in work the PAC may undertake on the response to the COVID-19 pandemic due to her membership of the Council of Ministers until January 2021, and her membership of the Statistics Law Steering Group.	
3. Links Between PAC Work Programme and C&AG Reports	
The Committee received a presentation from the C&AG regarding the links between the PAC's work programme and the reports published by the C&AG, noting that 80% of the PAC's work programme would consist of following-up on reports published by the C&AG. The Committee agreed to reference relevant reports by the Comptroller and Auditor General in each of their scoping documents.	
4. Governance Arrangements for Health and Social Care – Follow Up	
The Committee received a project specification on the C&AG's follow up work on Governance Arrangements for Health and Social Care, as issued in January 2021.	
5. Private Briefing from the Director General for Strategic Policy, Planning and Performance on the Use of the Performance Framework	

The Committee welcomed the Director General for Strategic Policy, Planning and Performance to a private briefing on the Use of the Performance Framework.

This briefing was held in private in accordance with the Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011 (as amended) under Qualified Exemption Article 35.

#### 5. Review of Estate Management

The Chair updated the Committee on the meeting of the Estate Management subgroup. The Committee noted the approved Terms of Reference and Scoping Document for its revised review of Estate Management and approved a draft press release.

The Committee received an update from Officers regarding the submission of written questions to the Chief Executive and Director Generals on Estate management and agreed to submit any additional questions by 9am on Tuesday 23rd February.

The Estate Management sub-group agreed to meet in mid-March to analyse answers and prepare further questions in response to them.

### 5. Review of Performance Management

The Committee noted the approved Terms of Reference and Scoping Document, alongside the released press release and draft questions to Director Generals on Performance Management, and agreed to submit any additional questions by 9am on Tuesday 23rd February.

#### 6. Office Accommodation

The Chair updated the Committee that an Office Accommodation Review Panel was being developed, and would include a representative from the PAC, Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel, Environment, Housing and Infrastructure Scrutiny Panel and the Scrutiny Liaison Committee.

The Chair further noted that within a month there had been a change of contractor, venue, funding mechanism and no confirmation on the decision process and governance in the development of this project.

Senator Vallois noted a total of six missing decisions regarding Jersey Property Holdings that were not accessible on the Ministerial Decisions webpage, with the Committee agreeing to request these decisions.

### 7. 2020 States of Jersey Annual Report and Accounts

The Committee received an update from Officers that letters had been sent to Director Generals and Non-Ministerial departments regarding their respective contributions to the 2020 Annual Report and Accounts.

#### 8. Citizens' Panels

The Committee noted a letter of the 2nd February 2021 from the Chief Executive regarding the establishment and operation of Citizens' Panels and agreed to discuss it further in private.

#### 9. Newsletter and Recall Sessions

The Committee received an update from the Chair regarding the creation of a PAC newsletter for circulation to States Members, following consultation with the Chair

of the UK's Public Accounts Committee. The Chair noted the UK PAC's use of recall sessions to ask stakeholders about specific events and items of work to prevent overspending.

The Chair also provided an overview to the Committee of the UK PAC's use of "recall" sessions, where stakeholders would be called in for a public hearing following specific events, such as the completion of a stage in a work programme. The Chair of the UK's PAC, Meg Hillier MP, had informed the Chair that this had helped to successfully prevent overspending.

#### 10. Next Meeting

The Committee noted that its next meeting would be held on Monday 8th March 2021 at 1pm via TEAMS and would include a private briefing from the Chief Internal Auditor on the Internal Audit Plan 2020-21 at 2pm.

### **Record of Meeting**

### Meeting held by video conference

Date: 8th March 2021

Present	Deputy Inna Gardiner (Chair) Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone (Vice-Chair) Senator Tracey Vallois Connétable John Le Maistre Connétable Richard Vibert
	Dr Helen Miles Mr Adrian Lane Mr Graeme Phipps Mr Paul van Bodegom
In attendance	Caro Tomlinson, Committee and Panel Officer Theo Stone, Research and Project Officer Lynn Pamment, Comptroller and Auditor General, C&AG
	Item 6 Only: Catherine Watson, Chief Internal Auditor Mike Thomas, Director of Risk and Audit Kevin Hemmings, Head of Financial Governance

Agenda matter	Action
1. Minutes	
The PAC approved the minutes of 22nd February 2021.	
2. Conflicts of Interest	
In relation to the Committee's consideration of scrutinising the Government's use of Citizens Panels and Juries, members of the PAC made the following declarations:	
The Chair and the Constable of Grouville declared an interest due to their involvement in an observational review of the Climate Change Citizens Panel.	
Dr Helen Miles declared an interest as a member of the Independent Advisory Panel of the Jersey Assisted Dying Citizens' Jury.	
Graeme Phipps declared an interest in having prior engagement with Friends of the New Hospital group prior to joining PAC.	
3. C&AG Audit Plan	
The Committee received a verbal update on the Comptroller and Auditor General's work for 2021. The C&AG confirmed that April was the likely date for publication of reports into the Governance of Health & Social Care and the Government of Jersey's Recommendations Tracker.	

The C&AG confirmed that she was undertaking ongoing work on the Integrated Technology Solution Programme and that a project specification to follow-up work on the States Employment Board had been published.

The C&AG provided an update to the Committee on work into the Annual Report and Accounts.

Having noted a briefing paper on the Use of Consultants, the Committee agreed that the Deputy Comptroller and Auditor General (DC&AG) could support the PAC on its reviews of the Annual Report and Accounts and Performance Management, with the C&AG providing support to the PAC on its reviews into Estate Management and the Government's Response to COVID-19.

The PAC further noted that Grace Nesbitt had been appointed as the new Chair of the C&AG's Board of Governance. The PAC Chair agreed to meet with the Board.

The Committee received a copy of the Executive Response to the C&AG's Thinkpiece on Public Audit in Jersey and agreed to follow-through on this area and provide a Comments Paper.

#### 4. Pre-Briefing Discussion

The Committee agreed to question the Chief Internal Auditor on how Internal Audit maintained its independence. The C&AG advised that she regularly liaised with the Chief Internal Auditor to discuss work programmes.

The Committee also agreed it should request the reports from the Chief Internal CT Auditor relevant to COVID-19 and Performance Management.

#### 5. BeHeard Employee Engagement Survey

The PAC noted the publication of the BeHeard Employee Engagement Survey. The PAC agreed to request a template copy of the staff questionnaire, enquire who validated it and request a breakdown of the contents by department. The Committee also agreed to ascertain how the 2017 survey had been disseminated, the role of Statistics Jersey and whether the 2020 results would be cross-referenced with the 2017 results.

## 6. Private Briefing from the Chief Internal Auditor on the Internal Audit Plan 2020-21

The Committee welcomed the Chief Internal Auditor to a private briefing on the Internal Audit Plan 2020-21.

This briefing was held in private in accordance with the Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011 (as amended) under Qualified Exemption Article 35.

#### 7. Further Written Questions to the Chief Executive

The Committee noted that a letter had been sent to the Chief Executive with questions on Estate Management, Performance Management, and follow-ups to his Quarterly Hearing, and a response, dated 23rd February 2021 had been received from him, regarding the PAC's request for Governance Statements from each Director General.

#### 7. Review of Estate Management

The Committee noted reports from 2018 on the cancelled refurbishment of Morier House. After expressing concerns over the status of internal auditing in this area

and whether issues were being raised and listened to, the Committee agreed that the Estate Management Sub-Group should consider this issue further. The Chair also agreed to raise the issue of sharing internal reports at the next Scrutiny Liaison Committee meeting.

#### 8. Citizens' Panels

The PAC briefly discussed the Government's use of Citizens' Panels and Juries and agreed to consider potential areas of questioning that could be submitted in writing to responsible officers.

Members of the PAC declared relevant interests in this area of work, which had been documented in Item 2.

The C&AG confirmed that she had not undertaken work in this area and the Committee agreed it should ensure any work undertaken would be in line with its responsibilities.

#### 9. PAC Meetings and Public Hearings

The Chair updated the PAC on plans to hold a private meeting with the new, interim Chief Executive and Treasurer of the States on the 2020 Annual Report and Accounts on the 12th April, before its public hearing with the Chief Executive on this item on the 26th April.

The Committee noted concerns over the continued use of consultants as reflected in the Chief Minister's recent update of February 2021 and the increase of costs of digital modernisation funding. It agreed to request the Chief Executive to attend a public hearing on these matters, together with the Chief Operating Officer and the Chief of Staff, with suggested dates of the 19th and 29th March 2021. The Committee agreed to attend on alternative dates if these were not suitable.

#### 10. Next Meeting

The PAC noted that its next meeting would be held on Monday 29th March 2021 at 1pm via TEAMS, to include a public hearing which would focus on the use of consultants and increased costs of the Digital Funding programme.

### **Record of Meeting**

### Meeting held by video conference

Date: 29th March 2021

Present	Deputy Inna Gardiner (Chair) Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone (Vice-Chair) Senator Tracey Vallois
	Connétable John Le Maistre
	Dr Helen Miles
	Mr Adrian Lane
	Mr Graeme Phipps
	Mr Paul van Bodegom
Apologies	Connétable Richard Vibert
In attendance	Caro Tomlinson, Committee and Panel Officer
	Theo Stone, Research and Project Officer
	Lynn Pamment, Comptroller and Auditor General, C&AG
	Item 4 only:
	Catherine Madden, Chief of Staff
	John Quinn, Chief Operating Officer
	Mark Grimley, Group Director, People & Corporate Services
	Camilla Black, Group Director, Technology Procurement
	Joanna Spybey, Head of Business Support

Agenda matter	Action
A BRITANIA	
1. Minutes	
The PAC approved the public and private minutes of 8th March 2021.	
2. Commissioner for Standards	
The Chair informed the Committee that she had referred herself to the Commissioner for Standards in respect of the former Chief Executive's letter dated 15th March 2021 where he had suggested she had been intimidatory in tone in requesting a public hearing with him before his departure. The Chair advised that she had forwarded all correspondence to the Commissioner on the matter and was expecting the Commissioner's judgment to be published shortly.  3. Question Plan for Public Hearing with the Chief Operating Officer and	
Chief of Staff	
The Committee approved an amended question plan for its Quarterly Hearing with the Chief of Staff and Chief Operating Officer.	
4. Public Hearing with the Chief Operating Officer and Chief of Staff	
The Committee welcomed the Chief of Staff and Chief Operating Officer to a public hearing by videoconference. It noted the hearing would be streamed live to the public and a transcript provided. Following the public hearing, the Committee agreed to write to both Officers and submit a series of additional questions to follow up on issues raised during the hearing.	СТ

#### 3. C&AG Audit Plan

The Committee received an update from the Comptroller and Auditor General (C&AG) on her Audit Plan.

The C&AG advised that her report on the Government's Covid-19 Related Emergency Support Scheme (CRESS) was scheduled to be published on 30th March 2021. The Committee noted that her findings were largely positive and that she had made only two recommendations, namely that business cases should more clearly follow risk and evaluation criteria, and to consider how the lessons and recommendations identified from CRESS could be shared and taken forward corporately as well as within Customer and Local Services. The Committee agreed to request an Executive Response before considering what follow up work to undertake.

The C&AG advised that her final piece of work on COVID-19 would be focused on 'test and trace' and the vaccine rollout, with work expected to begin in the coming months.

The C&AG outlined her remaining work for 2021, including following up previous work on the Recommendation Tracker Arrangements and the States Employment Board, with fieldwork recently launched on a follow-up of the Governance of Health and Social Care.

In relation to follow-up work by the Committee, the C&AG confirmed that her report on the ITS programme was expected to be published in Q2 2021. The Committee agreed to postpone consideration of appointing an IT advisor to the Committee until it had received the Executive Response to the C&AG's report and before embarking on its own review.

The Committee recalled it had previously published interim comments on the Executive Response to the C&AG's Report on Public Audit in Jersey. It approved the presentation of the Executive Response to the Anti-Corruption Arrangements Report, together with its interim comments, for presentation to the States Assembly. It agreed to follow up both matters later in the year.

#### 4. Estate Management Review

The Chair gave an update of the Estate Management subgroup's activities. The Committee noted that the subgroup would divide the responses of the Directors General to the Committee's written questions on Estate Management matters between members, with a view to considering further follow up questions. She advised that the subgroup would provide a draft set of verbal questions for the Director General of Children, Young People and Education Services (CYPES) to consider before its next meeting of 13th April 2021. These would be circulated to the rest of the Committee in time for the public hearing in May 2021.

Having noted that a lease had been signed for the Government's Broad Street Office premises, before the Island Public Estate Strategy had been made public, the Committee agreed it should amend its Terms of Reference for the Estate CT Management Review in order to incorporate scrutiny of the Office Strategy.

#### 5. Performance Management Review

Senator Vallois advised she would lead the Performance Management subgroup's activities and gave an update on progress to date. She advised that the subgroup

had divided the responses of the Directors General to the Committee's written questions on Performance Management matters between members, with a view to considering further follow up questions. She advised that the subgroup would provide a draft set of verbal questions for the Director General of Children, Young People and Education Services (CYPES) to consider before its next meeting of 15th April 2021. These would be circulated to the rest of the Committee in time for the public hearing in May 2021.  6. 2020 States Annual Report and Accounts	
6. 2020 States Annual Report and Accounts	
The PAC noted that the 2020 Annual Report and Accounts were expected to be signed off by the Chief Executive on 31st March 2021 and agreed to review them in line with its scheduled work programme, including preparing question areas for its private briefing with the external auditors (Mazars) and the new Chief Executive Officer on 12th April 2021.	
7. Citizens Panels	
The Committee recalled a letter dated 2nd February 2021 from the Chief Executive in relation to the Government's use of Citizens' Panels. The Committee agreed that it would not undertake a full review of their use but would submit further questions to the new Chief Executive, including a request for a value-for-money analysis of the Jersey Citizens Panel 2018 and Future Hospital Citizens Panel. It agreed it would then present a Comments Paper containing its findings.	
The Connétable of St Martin and Senator Vallois both declared a potential interest as a member and the Vice-Chair of the Privileges and Procedures Committee respectively, and withdrew from the discussion.	СТ
8. PAC Performance	
The Committee noted that the States Greffe Annual Report was due to be published, including a section on the Scrutiny function. It agreed that it should review its own performance as a Committee using some of the parameters and statistics as laid out in the report, for example numbers of reviews held and comments papers produced. Mr Lane and the C&AG agreed to circulate anonymised Board Assessments and structured questionnaires from which to draw potential areas to assess its performance.	
9. Future Meetings	
The PAC noted that its next meeting would be held on Monday 12th April 2021 at 1pm via TEAMS, to include a private briefing from Mazars on the 2020 Annual Report and Accounts and a private meeting with the Interim Chief Executive and Treasurer of the States.	

### **Record of Meeting**

### Meeting held by video conference

Date: 12th April 2021

Present	Deputy Inna Gardiner (Chair) Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone (Vice-Chair) (Item 7 onwards) Senator Tracey Vallois
	Dr Helen Miles Mr Adrian Lane
	Mr Graeme Phipps
	Mr Paul van Bodegom
Apologies	Connétable Richard Vibert
	Connétable John Le Maistre
In attendance	Caro Tomlinson, Committee and Panel Officer
	Theo Stone, Research and Project Officer
	Lynn Pamment, Comptroller and Auditor General, C&AG
	Item 7 only:
	Paul Martin, Interim Chief Executive Officer

Agenda matter	Action
1. Minutes	
The PAC approved the minutes of 29th March 2021.	
2. Declarations of Interest	
The Committee noted that Mr Lane, an independent PAC member, was employed at a Bank and was authorised to approve loan guarantees for the States of Jersey as part of his role. The Committee agreed he should withdraw from any discussions relating to the scrutiny of loan guarantees should they arise in a future work programme.	
2. Commissioner for Standards	
The Committee recalled that the Chair had referred herself to the Commissioner for Standards in respect of the former Chief Executive's letter dated 15th March 2021 where he had suggested she had been intimidatory in tone in requesting a public hearing with him before his departure. The Committee noted that the Commissioner's judgment had been published, confirming there had been no breach and no further action was to be taken.	
3. Follow up Questions to the Public Hearing with the Chief Operating Officer	
and Chief of Staff	
The Committee approved a series of additional questions to follow up on issues raised during the public hearing with the Chief of Staff and Chief Operating Officer on 29th March 2021.	1

#### 3. C&AG Audit Plan

The Committee received a written update from the Comptroller and Auditor General (C&AG) on her Audit Plan.

The C&AG outlined her remaining work for 2021, including following up previous work on the Recommendation Tracker Arrangements and the States Employment Board.

The Committee recalled that the C&AG's report on the Government's Covid-19 Related Emergency Support Scheme (CRESS) had been published on 30th March 2021 and the Committee had requested an Executive Response by 6th May 2021.

#### 4. Estate Management Review

The Chair gave an update of the Estate Management subgroup's activities. The Committee noted that the subgroup had divided the responses of the Director General's to the Committee's written questions on Estate Management matters between members, with a view to considering further follow up questions. She advised that the subgroup would meet on 13th April 2021 and would prepare verbal questions for the public hearing with the Director General of Children, Young People Education and Skills Department (CYPES) which would be circulated to the rest of the Committee in time for the public hearing on 26th April 2021.

The Committee agreed it would incorporate two aspects of the Office Strategy as part of its current Estate Management review, namely how the Government decided that renting the Broad Street premises for 3 years was the best option, and how did the funding mechanism and decision making align with strategy and corporate asset management plans. It further agreed that it should undertake a follow up review later in the year on the Office Strategy as a capital project, following the C&AG's planned Report on Capital Projects.

The Committee also noted a letter dated 31 March 2021 from the Chief Internal Auditor advising that the Committee should refer the questions it had asked relating to works outstanding by the Infrastructure, Housing and Environment Department, to that department. The letter also expressed reluctance to provide Internal Audit Reports in general. The Committee agreed to draft a letter to the Department asking for a progress update, however it also agreed that it would not be deterred from requesting further Internal Audit reports where they were relevant to an ongoing review.

CT

### 5. Performance Management Review

Senator Vallois gave an update on progress to date. She advised that the subgroup had divided the responses of the Director General's to the Committee's written questions on Performance Management matters between members, with a view to considering further follow up questions. She advised that the subgroup would meet on 15th April 2021 and would prepare further written questions for Director Generals where deemed necessary and would also prepare verbal questions for the public hearing with the Director General of Children, Young People Education and Skills Department (CYPES) which would be circulated to the rest of the Committee in time for the public hearing on 26th April 2021.

The Committee also noted a 'draft Recommendations closure process' from the	
Chief of Staff and agreed to respond with further suggestions for improvement to	CT
the process for closing recommendations on the Recommendations Tracker.	
6. 2020 States Annual Report and Accounts	
The Committee recalled that the Treasurer of the States had recently advised that	
the 2020 Annual Report and Accounts would not be signed off by 31st March 2021	
as previously indicated, and that there would be a delay for up to four weeks. The	
Committee also noted that the former Chief Executive had not signed off the	
Performance Report for inclusion in the Annual Report and Accounts and this	
responsibility would fall on the interim Chief Executive. The Committee agreed to	
delay its planned private briefing with the external auditors (Mazars) and the new	
Chief Executive Officer until the end of May 2021.	СТ
7. Private Briefing with Interim Chief Executive Officer	
The Committee welcomed the Interior Chief Type white to its receive to discuss	
The Committee welcomed the Interim Chief Executive to its meeting to discuss	
informally several matters including its right to request Internal Audit Reports	
where relevant to its reviews, future collaborative working practices, and the	
Interim Chief Executive's initial views on the many projects and ongoing structural changes to the Government Departments.	
8. Citizens' Panels	
The Committee approved follow up questions to the Chief Executive in relation to	
the Government's use of Citizens' Panels. Based on the response it received, it	
would then consider presenting a Comments Paper on its findings.	СТ
9. PAC Performance	
The Committee recalled that the States Greffe Annual Report was due to be	
published, including a section on the Scrutiny function. It agreed that it should	
review its own performance as a Committee using some of the parameters and	
statistics as laid out in the report, for example numbers of reviews held and	
comments papers produced. Mr Lane and the C&AG advised they had sent the	
officer anonymised Board Assessments and structured questionnaires from which	
to draw potential areas to assess its performance.	СТ
10. Hearing Protocol	
The Committee noted a public hearing protocol approved by the Scrutiny Liaison	
Committee. It agreed that as the Covid-19 guidelines on social distancing and	
public gatherings were relaxed, it would prefer to hold meetings in person rather	
than virtually and requested the officers to book suitably sized venues including	OT/TO
the States Chamber for future meetings and public hearings.	CT/TS
11. Revised Work Programme	
The Committee considered a revised work programme and agreed to hold longer	
meetings to accommodate public hearing and private briefings in future meetings.	
The Committee agreed its meetings should commence at 12:30 and conclude at	
16:30.	CT/TS
11. Future Meetings	
The PAC noted that its next meeting would be held on Monday 26th April 2021 at	
12:30 to include a public hearing with the Director General of CYPES.	СТ

### **Record of Meeting**

### Meeting held by video conference

Date: 26th April 2021

Present	Deputy Inna Gardiner (Chair)
	Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone (Vice-Chair)
	Senator Tracey Vallois
	Connétable Richard Vibert
	Connétable John Le Maistre
	Dr Helen Miles
	Mr Adrian Lane
	Mr Graeme Phipps
	Mr Paul van Bodegom
In attendance	Caro Tomlinson, Committee and Panel Officer
	Theo Stone, Research and Project Officer
	Lynn Pamment, Comptroller and Auditor General, C&AG
	Item 4 only:
	Julia Blazeby, Director General Justice & Home Affairs
	Kate Briden, Group Director, Public Protection and Law Enforcement

Agenda matter	Action
1. Minutes	
The PAC approved the minutes of 12th April 2021.	
3. C&AG Audit Plan	
The Committee received a written update from the Comptroller and Auditor General (C&AG) on her Audit Plan.	
The C&AG outlined her remaining work for 2021, including following up previous work on the Recommendation Tracker Arrangements, the States' Employment Board, and two further reports on elements of the Government's Covid-19 response to be published before the next PAC meeting on 10th May 2021.	
4. Public Hearing with Director General, Justice and Home Affairs	
The Committee welcomed the Director General, Justice and Home Affairs and senior officers to a public hearing by videoconference. It noted the hearing would be streamed live to the public and a transcript provided. Following the public hearing, the Committee agreed to write to the Director General with additional questions to follow up on issues raised during the hearing.	СТ
5. Estate Management Review	
The Chair advised that the subgroup would meet on 18th May 2021 at 2pm and would invite the Director of the States of Jersey Development Company and/or the Chair of the Corporate Asset Management Board for a private briefing at that meeting. It noted a draft letter to the Director General, Infrastructure Housing and Environment Department and asked the subgroup members to submit further	

amendments to the letter and suggestions regarding follow up letters to other Directors General by Thursday 29th April 2021. Having noted the next public hearing would take place on 10th May 2021 with the Director General, Children Young People, Skills and Education Department, the Committee also agreed to prepare a set of verbal questions relating to Estate Management by Tuesday 4th May 2021.	
5. Performance Management Review	
Senator Vallois advised that the subgroup would meet on 6th May 2021 at 1pm and Mr. Lane advised he would not be able to attend. The Committee noted a draft letter to the Director General, Justice and Home Affairs and asked the subgroup members to submit further amendments to the letter and suggestions regarding follow up letters to other Directors General and the Chief Executive Officer by Thursday 29th April 2021. Having noted the next public hearing would take place on 10th May 2021 with the Director General, Children Young People, Skills and Education Department, the Committee also agreed to prepare a set of questions relating to Performance Management by Tuesday 4th May 2021.  6. 2020 States Annual Report and Accounts	
6. 2020 States Annual Report and Accounts	
The Committee recalled that the Chief Minister had recently advised that the 2020 Annual Report and Accounts would not be signed off until the end of May 2021. The Committee noted that the Terms of Reference and scope of its review had been previously circulated and approved and it approved a press release, subject to minor amendments if necessary, for the launch of its review. It also agreed it should hold a private briefing with the external auditors (Mazars) on 10th May 2021, even if they had not signed off the Annual Report and Accounts by that date.  7. Letter to Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel from the Chief Minister	
The detail to deliporate delivious delivating hands from the different immeter	
The Committee noted a letter dated 15th April 2021 from the Chief Minister which the Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel had shared with the Committee because it contained information regarding the Office Modernisation Project and the Digital Transformation Project. The Committee agreed the information would be useful for the purposes of its Estate Management Review and a later review of IT services	
which it would undertake once the C&AG had completed her investigations.  8. Citizens' Panels	СТ
The Committee noted the minutes and costings of the Climate Conservation Project Citizens' Assembly. Having noted that there were budget anomalies compared to previous indications of cost by the former Chief Executive, the Committee also agreed to send a further request to the interim Chief Executive, asking for clarification. The Committee recalled it had already sent a letter to the interim Chief Executive in relation to the Government's use of Citizens' Panels and that a response was due on 7th May 2021. It agreed to await the completion of the work of the two current Citizens Panels before presenting a Comments Paper on its findings on whether the outcomes of such Panels met their initial objectives.  9. £100 voucher scheme	
The Committee considered a letter dated 30th March 2021 from the interim Chief Executive regarding the £100 voucher scheme. In the letter he referred to a report by the Chief Economist and the Committee agreed to request that report, together with any other report relating to the scheme before preparing a Comments Paper	
on its findings.	СТ
10. Recommendation Tracker Case Study	
	1

The Committee recalled the States Assembly debate of Friday 23rd April 2022,	
relating to the appointment of a Non-Executive Director to the States of Jersey	
Development Company. It agreed it would be timely to request an update from the Chief of Staff as to the progress of implementing the recommendations of the	
C&AG's reports on SOJDC (2020) and Remuneration of Board Members (2019).	
It agreed the information received could form a case study of tracking	
recommendations through the Government's Recommendations Tracker tool	
which would be useful for the Committee's ongoing Performance Management	
Review and potentially form part of a Comments paper following up on the C&AG	
reports.	CT
11. Questioning Witnesses Training update	
The Committee agreed the training on questioning witnesses it had received from	
the Attorney General had been very useful, however it agreed it would benefit from further specific training relating to PAC hearings. It noted that initial enquiries had	
been made with several organisations and that it would receive another half-day	
training on teamwork in June 2021.	TS
12. Next Meeting	
The PAC noted that its next meeting would be held on Monday 10th May 2021 at	
12:30 in the States Assembly Chamber to include a public hearing with the Director	
General of Customer and Local Services and a private briefing from the external	
auditors of the States Annual Report and Accounts.	TS

### **Record of Meeting**

Date: 10th May 2021

Drocent	Donuty Inna Cardinar (Chair)
Present	Deputy Inna Gardiner (Chair)
	Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone (Vice-Chair)
	Senator Tracey Vallois
	Connétable Richard Vibert
	Connétable John Le Maistre
	Dr Helen Miles
	Mr Adrian Lane (via videolink)
	Mr Graeme Phipps
	Mr Paul van Bodegom
In attendance	Caro Tomlinson, Committee and Panel Officer
	Theo Stone, Research and Project Officer
	Lynn Pamment, Comptroller and Auditor General (C&AG)
	Item 4 only:
	Ian Burns, Director General Customer and Local Services (CLS)
	Sophie Le Sueur, Group Director, Customer and Local Services (CLS)

Agenda matter	Action
1. Minutes	
The PAC approved the minutes of 26th April 2021 and agreed that, in future, an 'actions log' recording the subsequent actions to be taken should be provided with the minutes of the last meeting.  2. C&AG Audit Plan	СТ
The Committee received a written update from the Comptroller and Auditor General (C&AG) on her Audit Plan, including a project specification on Annual Reporting.	
The Committee noted the Executive Response to the C&AG's Report on the Covid-19 Related Emergency Support Scheme and approved its presentation to the States Assembly. It agreed that once the six 'Covid Response' reports of the C&AG had been published by June 2021 it would undertake its own review and provide further comments on the Executive Responses received.	ст
3. Social Security Funds	
The Committee, having noted that there had been recent social media speculation about the legality of using Social Security Funds to fund the Jersey Care Model, received a presentation from the C&AG regarding the use of the Social Security Funds. The Committee agreed that although the funds including the Health Insurance Fund were being used legitimately, there was concern about the long-term sustainability of such funds which should be raised at its next public hearing with the Treasurer of the States and the Chief Executive. The Committee also agreed that the Chair should meet with the Chair of the Health and Social Services	

Scrutiny Panel to discuss issuing a joint statement for the benefit of the public, on the status of the various Funds.	СТ
4. Public Hearing with Director General, Customer and Local Services	
The Committee welcomed the Director General and the Group Director, Customer and Local Services to a public hearing. It noted the hearing would be streamed live to the public and a transcript provided. Following the public hearing, the Committee agreed to write to the Director General with additional questions to follow up on issues raised during the hearing.  5. Estate Management Review	
The Committee noted the next subgroup meeting would take place on 18th May 2021 and would include a private briefing from the Director of States of Jersey Development Company. It agreed there should be two further subgroup meetings in June and one in July, with the Corporate Asset Management Chair being invited to attend one of them. The second follow up letters for the Directors General would be sent out later in the week after final sign off from the Chair, and the Committee agreed it would approve the Heads of Report at its 28th June meeting.	
The Committee further agreed to request clarification from the Director of Estates on whether he had received legal advice on his previously stated opinion that undertaking accessibility assessments on the States' Estate were 'reasonable endeavours' to comply with disability legislation.  5. Performance Management Review	
The Committee noted the next subgroup meetings would take place on 18th May, 10th June and 15th July 2021. The second follow up letters for the Directors General would be discussed between Senator Vallois and the Chair of the PAC later in the week and would be sent out after final sign off from the Chair.	
6. 2020 States Annual Report and Accounts	
The Committee noted the 2020 Annual Report and Accounts were likely to be signed off on 20th May 2021. The Committee agreed that a press release should be issued by the Chair to correspond with the C&AG's report which was also due to be published on 20th May 2021. The Committee agreed to hold separate private briefings with the external auditors (Mazars) and the Chief Executive and Treasurer of the States on 24th May 2021. It further agreed that the public hearing scheduled for 7th June 2021 with the Treasurer of the States and the Chief Executive should focus on the States Annual Report and Accounts	
7. Letter from Chief Operating Officer	
The Committee noted a letter dated 5th May 2021 from the Chief Operating Officer containing answers to questions following up from the public hearing of 29th March 2021. The Committee agreed to raise the issue of completing 'structured needs assessments' before appointing consultants with the Treasurer at its public hearing of 7th June 2021 but would set aside the information received about the transformation of Information Technology services until such time as the C&AG had completed her investigations.	
8. Citizens' Panels	
The Committee recalled it had sent a letter to the interim Chief Executive in relation to the Government's use of Citizens' Panels and that a response had been due on 7th May 2021, however, the officer compiling the response on behalf of the Executive had requested and been granted a short extension to 11th May 2021.	

The Committee agreed to await the completion of the work of the two current	
Citizens Panels before presenting a Comments Paper on its findings on whether	
	СТ
9. Correspondence from Director General, Justice & Home Affairs	
The Committee considered correspondence dated 5th May 2021 from the Director General, Justice and Home Affairs, following up from the public hearing of 26th April 2021. The Committee agreed he had provided a comprehensive response to its outstanding questions which should be included in the Performance Management Report. The Committee also agreed to request clarification on the context of his reference to 'poor response times' contained in his letter.	СТ
10. Corporate Risk Register	
The Committee noted correspondence dated 6th May 2021 from the Head of Risk and Audit on the Corporate Risk Register. He advised that the Corporate Risk Register was maintained within the Risk and Audit Team and was held on a SharePoint site which had been updated at the beginning of 2021. The register would be reviewed quarterly by the Executive Leadership Team and the Committee, having noted it would be reviewed next on 19th May 2021, agreed that it should hold a private briefing with the Head of Risk and Audit soon thereafter.  12. Next Meeting	TS
The PAC noted that its next meeting would be held on Monday 24th May 2021 at 12 noon to 5pm, in the Le Capelain Room, States Buildings, to include a public hearing with the Director General of Children, Young People, Education and Skills and separate private briefings from the external auditors of the States Annual Report and Accounts and the Chief Executive and the Treasurer of the States.	TS

### **Record of Meeting**

Date: 24th May 2021

Present	Deputy Inna Gardiner (Chair) Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone (Vice-Chair) Senator Tracey Vallois (withdrew from Item 4) Connétable John Le Maistre (via videolink) Dr Helen Miles Mr Adrian Lane Mr Graeme Phipps Mr Paul van Bodegom
Apologies	Connétable Richard Vibert
In attendance	Lynn Pamment, Comptroller and Auditor General (C&AG) Caro Tomlinson, Committee and Panel Officer Theo Stone, Research and Project Officer
	Item 4 only: Mark Rogers, Director General Children Young People Education and Skills (CYPES) Keith Posner, Head of Office, Education

Agenda matter	Action
1. Minutes	
The PAC approved the minutes of 10th May 2021 and noted the 'actions log' listing the progress of matters since the last meeting.  2. Declarations of Interest	СТ
In accordance with the <u>Code of Practice</u> , Senator Vallois referred to her previous role as Minister for Education. The Committee agreed that, given her previous role, Senator Vallois should not take part in the public hearing with the Director General of CYPES later that day.	
Dr Miles declared that she was a part-time lecturer at Highlands and was therefore employed indirectly by the Director General of CYPES, however the Committee noted that there were no question areas relating to Highlands and that she was not part of the decision making process relating to it. Therefore Dr Miles was not considered to be conflicted and could take part in the questioning of the Director General of CYPES later that day.	СТ
3. C&AG Audit Plan	
The Committee received a written update from the Comptroller and Auditor General (C&AG) on her Audit Plan, including a detailed presentation on the recent review of the States Employment Board (Follow-up: Employment of the Former Chief Executive). The Committee noted that the Executive Response to this report was due on 2nd July 2021 and that it would inform its review of the States Annual Report and Accounts 2020. The Committee also received a presentation on the C&AG's third report on the Government's Covid-19 Response, namely	

'Procurement and Supply Chain Management'. The Committee noted that the Executive Response to the report was due on 11th June 2021 and confirmed that when the six 'Covid Response' reports of the C&AG had been published by June 2021 it would undertake its own review and provide further comments on the Executive Responses received. The Committee further noted that the C&AG's Annual Report and Accounts for 2020 had been published and agreed it would like to receive a presentation at its next meeting. CT 3. States Annual Report and Accounts 2020 The Committee noted the 2020 Annual Report and Accounts had been published on 20th May 2021 and a press release had been issued on its review, to coincide with its publication and with the C&AG's report on the Employment of the Chief Executive published on the same day. The Committee welcomed representatives of the external auditors (Mazars) and the Chief Executive and Treasurer of the States to separate private briefings in relation to the States Annual Report and Accounts, with particular reference to the former Chief Executive's exit payment of £500,000 and the Qualified Opinion issued by the external auditors on that matter. The Mazars' representatives agreed to share their Audit Completion Report with the Committee on a confidential basis and the Committee agreed that matters therein should form the basis of questions to the Chief Executive Officer and the Treasurer of the States at the public hearing of 7th June 2021. The Committee noted draft 'Heads of Report' and agreed to consider further at its next meeting. CT 4. Public Hearing with Director General, Children. Young People, Education and Skills The Committee welcomed the Director General and the Head of Office (Education) to a public hearing. It noted the hearing would be streamed live to the public and a transcript provided. Following the public hearing, the Committee agreed to write to the Director General with additional questions to follow up on issues raised СТ during the hearing. 5. Next Meeting The Committee noted that its next meeting would be held on Monday 7th June

The Committee noted that its next meeting would be held on Monday 7th June 2021 at 12:30 to 16:30, in Le Capelain Room, States Building, to include a public hearing with the interim Chief Executive Officer and the Treasurer of the States, and a private briefing from the Director of Risk and Audit.

TS

### **Record of Meeting**

Date: 7th June 2021

Present	Deputy Inna Gardiner (Chair)
	Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone (Vice-Chair)
	Senator Tracey Vallois
	Connétable Richard Vibert
	Dr Helen Miles
	Mr Adrian Lane
	Mr Graeme Phipps
	Mr Paul van Bodegom
Apologies	Connétable John Le Maistre
In attendance	Lynn Pamment, Comptroller and Auditor General (C&AG)
	Caro Tomlinson, Committee and Panel Officer
	Theo Stone, Research and Project Officer
	Item 4 only:
	Paul Martin, interim Chief Executive Officer
	Richard Bell, Treasurer of the States
	Item 6 only:
	Mike Thomas, Director of Risk and Audit
	Martin Gavet, Head of Risk, Treasury and Exchequer (via videolink)
	Jo Spybey, Head of Business Support, Human Resources (via videolink)
	Emily Thomas, Business Support Officer, HR (via videolink)

Agenda matter	Action
1. Minutes	
The PAC approved the minutes of 24th May 2021 and noted the 'actions log' listing the progress of matters since the last meeting.	СТ
2. C&AG Audit Plan	
The Committee received a written update from the Comptroller and Auditor General (C&AG) on her Audit Plan and also noted the Office of the C&AG's Annual	
Report and Accounts for 2020.  3. States Annual Report and Accounts 2020 Review	
3. States Affilial Report and Accounts 2020 Review	
The Committee approved the draft 'Heads of Report' and agreed to consider it further at its next meeting.	TS
4. Public Hearing with Chief Executive Officer and Treasurer of the States	
The Committee welcomed the interim Chief Executive Officer and Treasurer of the States, together with the Director of Risk and Audit, to a public hearing. It noted the hearing would be streamed live to the public and a transcript provided. Following the public hearing, the Committee agreed to write to the Chief Executive Officer and the Treasurer with additional questions to follow up on issues raised	
during the hearing.	CT

# 5. Executive Response to C&AG's Report

The Committee noted the Executive Response to the C&AG's second report on the Government's Covid-19 Response, namely 'Management in Healthcare'. Noting that the formal response did not include an Executive Summary and appeared to contain some factual errors, the Committee agreed to delay its presentation to the States Assembly, pending further enquiries of the Chief Executive.

The Committee confirmed that when the six 'Covid Response' reports of the C&AG had been published by June 2021 it would undertake its own review and provide further comments on the Executive Responses received.

CT

### 6. Private Briefing with Director of Risk and Audit

The Committee welcomed Mike Thomas and his team to a private briefing on the Corporate Risk Register and the Recommendations Tracker. Following the briefing, the Committee asked for a copy of the presentation slide deck and agreed to provide clarification questions to the Director by the end of the week.

This briefing was held in private in accordance with the Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011 (as amended) under Qualified Exemption Article 35.

CT

### 7. Estate Management Review

The Committee recalled that the Estate Management subgroup had met with the Managing Director of the States of Jersey Development Company on 18th May 2021 and noted a letter had been sent to him containing several follow-up questions after the meeting. The Committee noted his response was due on 21st June 2021.

The Committee noted that the Chair of the Corporate Asset Management Board would attend the next subgroup meeting of 15th June 2021, and that the subgroup would also discuss the draft 'Heads of Report' of the Estate Management Review and the recent advice from the Director of Estates in relation to his approach to the States' property disability legislation compliance. The Committee also agreed to seek advice from the Solicitor General about the same matter.

СТ

#### 8. Performance Management Review

The Committee noted points of clarification from the Chief of Staff on the Recommendations Tracker and agreed the Performance Management subgroup should discuss in more detail at its next meeting of 10th June 2021.

СТ

### 9. Citizens' Panels

The Committee noted the interim Chief Executive's response, dated 12th May 2021, to the Committee's queries on the constitution and value for money of Citizens' Panels. Having noted that the current Standing Orders only provided for Comments papers to be presented to the States if they were related to a report, the Committee agreed it would explore the possibility of linking its findings with that of any published report by any of the Citizens' Panels. However, it also agreed that the Chair of the PAC should explore submitting a proposition to amend the Standing Orders to allow for a 'standalone' Comments paper on topics within its CT remit to be presented to the States.

#### 10. Spend Local Card Scheme

The Committee considered a draft Comments Paper on the Spend Local card scheme and agreed to submit further comments and amendments to the officer by the end of the week. Having noted that the C&AG had not planned to include consideration of the Scheme in any Covid-19 response reports, and that current Standing Orders only provided for Comments papers to be presented to the States if they were related to such a report, the Committee agreed it would explore whether it would be possible to link its findings with that of any published report by another Scrutiny Panel which had considered aspects of the Scheme, such as the Corporate Services or Economic and International Affairs Scrutiny Panels.

11. Next Meeting

The Committee noted that its next meeting would take place at 12:30 on Monday 28th June 2021, to include a public hearing with the Director General, Health and Community Services. The Committee agreed it should ask the Director General if she would be willing to extend the public hearing time to two hours, given the large

TS

volume of matters to be addressed.

### **Record of Meeting**

Date: 28th June 2021

Present	Deputy Inna Gardiner (Chair)
	Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone (Vice-Chair)
	Senator Tracey Vallois
	Connétable John Le Maistre
	Connétable Richard Vibert
	Dr Helen Miles
	Mr Adrian Lane
	Mr Graeme Phipps (via videolink)
	Mr Paul van Bodegom
In attendance	Lynn Pamment, Comptroller and Auditor General (C&AG)
	Caro Tomlinson, Committee and Panel Officer
	Theo Stone, Research and Project Officer
	Item 9 only:
	Caroline Landon, Director General for Health and Community Services
	Anuschka Muller, Director of Improvement and Innovation
	Robert Sainsbury, Group Managing Director for Health and Community
	Services
	Michelle Roach, Head of Finance Business Partnering (via videolink)

Agenda matter	Action
1. Minutes	
The PAC approved the minutes of 7th June 2021 and noted the 'actions log' listing the progress of matters since the last meeting and noted that Officers were organising a training session for the Committee for using Microsoft Teams.	
2. Conflicts of Interest	
Adrian Lane declared a conflict of interest through his professional responsibility with Lloyds' evaluation of the Revolving Credit Facility, which was mentioned in the C&AG's Review of the Overall Management of Public Finances during COVID-19. The Committee agreed he would not take part in matters relating to this area.	
3. Audit Plan Update	
The Committee received a presentation from the C&AG on the Overall Management of Public Finances during COVID-19, and were provided with the project specifications for the C&AG's reviews of the Governance of the States of Jersey Police Force (Follow-Up) and the Long-Term Care Fund.	
The Committee agreed to consider the review on the Long-Term Care Fund as part of its upcoming review on the Government of Jersey's response to COVID-19 in September.	
4. Executive Response to Healthcare Management Report	

The Committee received the Executive Response to the C&AG's second report on the Government's COVID-19 Response (Healthcare Management) and approved its presentation to the States Assembly. The Committee agreed to draft a comments paper on the Recommendations made by the Comptroller and Auditor General, that have not been taken up in the Executive Response.

The Committee agreed to request the Executive Response to the C&AG's fourth report on the Government of Jersey's response to COVID-19.

### 5. Executive Response to Procurement and Supply Chain Report

The Committee received the Executive Response and agreed to draft a comments paper on the decision-making processes outlined in the C&AG's report.

#### 6. States Annual Report and Accounts 2020

The Committee noted confidential advice received from the Solicitor General in relation to its review of the States Annual Report and Accounts 2020 and agreed to incorporate his response into formulating questions for its upcoming public hearing with the Chair of the States Employment Board on 9th July 2021. The Committee further noted that the upcoming training session with BeSpoke Skills would include re-drafting Question Plans for the Committee's public hearings on Friday 9th July and Monday 12th July 2021.

#### 7. Estate Management Review

The Committee agreed to reschedule the meeting of its Estate Management Subgroup from Monday 12th July 2021 to Tuesday 6th July 2021 where it would consider the following:

- The response of the States of Jersey Development Company's Managing Director following the Subgroup's meeting of 18th May 2021;
- The response of the Corporate Asset Management Board Chair to followup questions of the Subgroup meeting of 15th June 2021; and
- The responses to follow-up letters to Directors General received on 21st June 2021:
- A draft Question Plan for the Director General of Infrastructure, Housing and Environment on 12th July 2021.

#### 8. Performance Management Review

The Committee agreed that no Performance Management questions should be asked at the next two upcoming Public Hearings, but that any follow up work for this review would be based on the written responses from Directors General, due on 2nd July 2021.

# 9. Public Hearing with the Director General for Health and Community Services

The Committee welcomed the Director General for Health and Community Services, together with the Director of Improvement and Innovation, Group Managing Director for Health and Community Services and Head of Finance Business Partnering, to a public hearing. It noted the hearing would be streamed live to the public and a transcript provided.

Following the public hearing, the Committee agreed to write to the Director General for Health and Community Services to submit additional questions to follow up on issues raised during the hearing.

### 10. Next Meeting

The Committee noted that its next meetings would take place as follows:

- At 13:30 on Thursday 8th July for a private training session with BeSpoke Skills on developing questioning skills during public hearings;
- At 15:30 on Friday 9th July 2021 for a public hearing with the Chair of the States Employment Board; and
- At 12:30 on Monday 12th July 2021, to include a public hearing with the Director General for Infrastructure, Housing and Environment at 14:00.

### **Record of Meeting**

Date: 9th July 2021

Present	Deputy Inna Gardiner (Chair) Senator Tracey Vallois Connétable John Le Maistre Dr Helen Miles Mr Adrian Lane Mr Graeme Phipps Mr Paul van Bodegom
Apologies	Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone (Vice-Chair) Mr Adrian Lane
In attendance	Lynn Pamment, Comptroller and Auditor General (C&AG) Caro Tomlinson, Committee and Panel Officer Theo Stone, Research and Project Officer  John Le Fondre, Chair of the States Employment Board Mark Grimley, Group Director for People and Corporate Services Darren Woodside, Senior Legal Advisor

Agenda matter	Action
1. Public Hearing with the Chair of the States Employment Board	
The Committee welcomed the Chair of the States Employment Board, together with the Group Director for People and Corporate Services and Senior Legal Advisor to a public hearing. It noted the hearing would be streamed live to the public and a transcript provided.	
Following the public hearing, the Committee agreed to write to the Chair of the States Employment Board to submit additional questions to follow up on issues raised during the hearing.	СТ

### **Record of Meeting**

Date: 12th July 2021

Present	Deputy Inna Gardiner (Chair)
	Senator Tracey Vallois
	Connétable Richard Vibert
	Dr Helen Miles
	Mr Adrian Lane
	Mr Graeme Phipps (via videolink)
	Mr Paul van Bodegom
Apologies	Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone (Vice-Chair)
	Mr Adrian Lane
In attendance	Lynn Pamment, Comptroller and Auditor General (C&AG)
	Caro Tomlinson, Committee and Panel Officer
	Item 9 only:
	Andrew Scate, Director General of Infrastructure, Housing and
	Environment
	Tim Daniels, Director of Jersey Property Holdings

Agenda matter	Action
1. Minutes	
The PAC approved the minutes of 28th June 2021.	
2. Action Log	
The Committee noted the activity log and progress on various items including the collation of evidence for its upcoming reports on the 2020 Annual Report and Accounts and Estate Management.	
3. Resignation of the Connétable of St Peter from the Public Accounts Committee	
The Committee noted that the Connétable of St Peter had resigned from the Committee following his appointment as Assistant Minister for Children and Education. It agreed that the Chair of PAC should approach the Constable of St John and the new Constable of St Clement, following their election on the 28th July 2021, to see if they would wish to be nominated for membership of the Committee.	СТ
4. Audit Plan Update	
The Committee received a verbal update from the C&AG in respect of her Audit Plan for 2021.	
5. Executive Response to the C&AG Report on SEB	
The Committee received the Executive Response to the C&AG's follow up Report on the States Employment Board (SEB): Employment of the Former Chief Executive and agreed to incorporate comments it might wish to make in its report on the 2020 States Annual Report and Accounts. Having recalled its public hearing	

with the Chair of the States Employment Board on 9th July 2021, the Committee	
noted the Chair of SEB had offered to meet with the Committee privately to discuss	
aspects of the former Chief Executive's severance contract which could not be	
·	
disclosed in public. The Committee agreed that such a meeting should take place	_
before the end of July (preferably on a date it was already due to meet) but that it	CT
would not delay the drafting and subsequent publication of its report.	
6. Public Hearing with the Director General for Infrastructure, Housing and	
Environment	
Environment	
The Committee welcomed the Director General for Infrastructure, Housing and	
Environment and the Director of Jersey Property Holdings to a public hearing. It	
noted the hearing would be streamed live to the public and a transcript provided.	
Indica the flearing would be discurred live to the public and a named provided.	
Following the public hearing the Committee agreed to write to the Director Concret	
Following the public hearing, the Committee agreed to write to the Director General	
for Infrastructure, Housing and Environment to submit additional questions to	
follow up on issues raised during the hearing.	CT
7. Performance Management	
The Panel received answers from Director Generals in response to follow-up	
questions on Performance Management, alongside the second tranche of answers	
to written questions from the Director of Risk and Audit. It agreed to defer work on	
the review in order to allow the Performance Management Subgroup's meeting on	
Wednesday 15th July to consider the evidence collated for the Committee's Report	
	СТ
8. 2020 States Annual Report and Accounts	01
6. 2020 States Annual Report and Accounts	
The Committee considered the evidence collated and draft findings and	
recommendations for its report on the 2020 States Annual Report and Accounts.	
It agreed it would further consider all the evidence at its meeting of 26th July 2021.	CT
9. R.118/2021 Reporting on the Use of Consultants	
The state of the s	
The Committee noted the publication of 'Consultants: Reporting on Their Use by	
the Government of Jersey (P.59/2019)' [R.118/2021] and agreed to produce a	
comments paper in due course.	CT
10. Next Meeting	
The Committee noted that its next meeting will take place at 12:30pm on Monday	
26th July in the Le Capelain Room, and that a training session with ALX on using	
Microsoft Teams will take place at 09:30am on Thursday 15th July 2021 in the Icho	
Room, Morier House.	СТ

# **Record of Meeting**

Date: 13th September 2021

1	
Present	Deputy Inna Gardiner (Chair)
	Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone (Vice-Chair)
	Dr Helen Miles
	Mr Adrian Lane (Items $1-3$ )
	Mr Graeme Phipps
	Mr Paul van Bodegom
Apologies	Senator Tracey Vallois
In attendance	Lynn Pamment, Comptroller and Auditor General (C&AG) Caro Tomlinson, Committee and Panel Officer Theodore Stone, Research & Project Officer Edward Le Gallais, Communications Officer (Item 3 only)
	Observing:
	Connétable Andy Jehan
	Commotable 7 thay condit
	Item 9 only:
	Paul Martin, Interim Chief Executive
	Richard Bell, Treasurer of the States
	Andrew Scate, Director General for Infrastructure, Housing and
	Environment
	Tom Walker, Director General for Strategic Policy, Planning and Performance

Agenda matter	Action
1. Membership of the PAC	
The PAC welcomed the Constable of St John to the meeting, who was attending as an observer. The Chair informed the Committee that she would nominate the Constable of St John as a member of the Committee at the next meeting of the States Assembly on Tuesday 14th September 2021.	
2. Question Plan	
The Committee discussed and finalised the question plan for its Public Quarterly Hearing with the Chief Executive and agreed an order of questioning.	
3. Public Quarterly Hearing with the Chief Executive	
The Committee welcomed the Interim Chief Executive, Treasurer of the States and Directors General for Infrastructure, Housing and Environment and Strategic Policy, Planning and Performance to a public hearing in the States Chamber. The hearing was recorded with a transcript provided.	
Following the hearing, the Committee met with its Communications Officer and agreed to draft a press release noting concerns regarding the following areas:	

- The recruitment strategy and commitment to a normalised recruitment strategy within Jersey Property Holdings and Infrastructure, Housing and Environment;
- To highlight the lack of clarity re. roles and responsibilities within Estate Management;
- The £6.6 million financial spend of the Jersey Care Model and £5.8 million in the growth of healthcare provision, alongside the absence of an oversight board;
- To highlight that the Corporate Parenting Board had not met since September 2020;
- To accept the publication of the Financial Recovery Plan;
- To note that the PAC had asked about the status of staff morale within the Government of Jersey.
- To further note the SOJDC-commissioned report expected by the end of September on its relationship with Jersey Property Holdings (and to encourage the Government of Jersey to publish it; and
- To note progress with the Recommendations Tracker and the implementation of associated recommendations.

The PAC agreed to write to the Chief Executive to request clarity on the spend on the Jersey Care Model. The Committee further agreed to request information on the timeline of spend on the Jersey Care Model from January 2021, and to receive clarity on the status of Board(s) with responsibility for the oversight of the Jersey Care Model.

## 4. Work Programme

The Committee reviewed its Work Programme and noted that the Estate Management sub-group would receive the draft Estate Management report on Thursday 15th September 2021 for review. The Committee agreed to extend its COVID review to February 2021.

#### 5. Review of COVID-19

The Committee received and approved the Terms of Reference and Scoping Document for its review – the Committee agreed to include Parishes and faith and cultural communities in the list of stakeholders for its review.

The Committee further agreed to start drafting letters to Stakeholders and that the COVID-19 subgroup, led by the Vice-Chair, should meet at 3:30 pm on Thursday 23rd September.

#### 5. C&AG Audit Plan

The Committee received an update from the C&AG regarding her Audit Plan, including the project specification on her upcoming review of Cyber-Security, alongside continuing work on COVID-19 and the ITS Programme, and noted the impact of the reports on the ITS Programme and Cyber Security on the Committee's upcoming reviews of ICTS and Capital Projects.

CT

TS

The Committee noted that the C&AG would comment on the communications	
protocol provided by the Chief Internal Auditor to the Committee and that this would	
result in a letter to the Chief Internal Auditor with suggested improvements.	
6. Future Meetings of the PAC	
The PAC agreed to consider extending the length of its meetings and to request	
officers to draft a supplementary agenda for Members to approve all remaining	
litama an ita aganda hy Manday 20th Cantambar 2021	
items on its agenda by Monday 20th September 2021.	TS
10. Next Meeting	IS
	18
10. Next Meeting  The Committee noted that its next meeting will take place at 12:00pm on Monday 4th October in the Blampied Room and would include a public hearing with the	
10. Next Meeting  The Committee noted that its next meeting will take place at 12:00pm on Monday	

# **Record of Electronic Virtual Meeting**

Date: 20th September 2021

Present	Deputy Inna Gardiner (Chair) Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone (Vice-Chair) Senator Tracey Vallois Connétable Andy Jehan Dr Helen Miles Mr Adrian Lane Mr Graeme Phipps Mr Paul van Bodegom
Apologies	<u> </u>
In attendance	Lynn Pamment, Comptroller and Auditor General (C&AG) Caro Tomlinson, Committee and Panel Officer Theodore Stone, Research & Project Officer

Agenda matter	Action
1. Executive Response to C&AG Review of Overall Management of Public Finances during the COVID-19 pandemic	
The PAC noted the Executive Response to the above report had been presented to the States Assembly on 3 August 2021. It agreed comments on the Response would be incorporated into its review of the Government's response to the pandemic, to be launched on 20th September, with the Vice-Chair of PAC taking the lead in the review.	СТ
2. Executive Response to the PAC Report on the States Annual Report and Accounts 2020	
The Committee noted the Executive Response was due on 21st September and agreed it should be circulated to the Committee and comments added before being presented to the States Assembly.	TS
3. Public Quarterly Hearing with the Chief Executive – COVID-19 Review	
The Committee recalled that at the public hearing with the interim Chief Executive on 13th September 2021, he had agreed to receive preliminary questions on the Government's response to the pandemic. The Committee agreed a list of questions should be sent to him and submissions should be sought from stakeholders, following further discussion at the review subgroup's meeting on 23rd September 2021.	
4. PAC Performance Assessment Criteria	
The Committee reviewed and approved its Performance Assessment criteria and agreed a version should be circulated to the Committee and included in its Legacy Report.	
5. Anti-Corruption Arrangements	
The Committee noted an updated action plan dated 10th September from the interim Chief Executive on Anti-Corruption Arrangements and noted that particular	

emphasis would be placed on developing an Anti-Corruption Policy and Counter Fraud and Corruption Strategy, with emphasis placed on raising awareness in staff on these matters. It also noted that the Greffier of the States had sent an update	
and advised that recommendations to strengthen Anti-Corruption arrangements	
had been sent to the Privileges and Procedures Committee, with a further update	
expected in October 2021.	
5. Citizens' Panels	
The Committee received a letter dated 6th September 2021 from the Chief Executive responding to questions posed by the Committee on the use of Citizens' Panels. It agreed to draft a short report on their use, to be considered further at its next meeting of 4th October 2021.	
	TS
6. Spend Local Report	
The Committee noted a draft report on the Spend Local Scheme and agreed to provide additional comments by the end of 20th September 2021. It noted that a	
draft would be sent to Government officers quoted in the report, for fact checking.	TS
10. Next Meeting	
The Committee noted that its next meeting would take place at 12:00pm on	
Monday 4th October in the Blampied Room, to include a public hearing with the	
Directors General for Strategic Policy, Planning and Performance and Customer	
and Local Services at 13:30pm.	СТ

# **Record of Meeting**

Date: 4th October 2021

Present	Deputy Inna Gardiner (Chair) Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone (Vice-Chair) (Item 4 onwards) Connétable John Le Maistre Senator Tracey Vallois Dr Helen Miles Mr Adrian Lane Mr Graeme Phipps
Apologies	Connétable Andy Jehan Paul van Bodegom
In attendance	Lynn Pamment, Comptroller and Auditor General (C&AG) Caro Tomlinson, Committee and Panel Officer Theodore Stone, Research & Project Officer Edward Le Gallais, Communications Officer
	Item 5 only: Ian Burns, Director General for Customer and Local Services Tom Walker, Director General for Strategic Policy, Planning and Performance Professor Peter Bradley, Director of Public Health Ian Cope – Interim Director of Statistics and Analytics Steve Skelton – Group Director, Strategy and Innovation

Agenda matter	Action
1. Minutes	
The PAC approved the minutes of its meetings of 13th September and 20th	
September 2021.	
2. Arrangement of Public Hearings	
The PAC agreed to rearrange its public hearing with the Chief Operating Officer to	
facilitate an in-person meeting and to invite representatives from Team Jersey. It	
also agreed to organise a public hearing with the Chief of Staff following the	
publication of the C&AG's report on the Recommendations Tracker. The PAC	
decided to hold public hearings with the Treasurer of the States and the incoming Director General for the Department for the Economy, then a joint public hearing	
with the Director Generals for Children, Young People, Education and Skills and	
Health and Community Services in November 2021. The Committee determined to	
review its proposed meeting dates, considering the Comité des Connétables, the	
Privileges and Procedures Committee, and school holidays. It also agreed to	
reschedule its training session with Kate Faragher following confirmation of	
rescheduled public hearings.	
3. Work Programme	
The PAC reviewed its Work Programme and agreed to consider a review of the	
Integrated Technology Solution beginning in January 2021. The PAC further	

agreed to receive a briefing from advisors who supported the C&AG Report on ICTS to improve its understanding of the findings, conclusions, and recommendations of the report.

#### 4. C&AG Audit Plan

The Committee received an update from the C&AG on her audit plan for 2021. The Committee noted that the C&AG had appointed new auditors Smith & Williamson to audit the Public Employees' Pension Fund and the Teachers Superannuation Pension Fund.

The C&AG had completed work on the Government of Jersey's support schemes for business during the COVID-19 Pandemic and had commenced field work on the Long-Term Care Fund. She advised that a draft report had been issued on ICTS, with a final version to be published in late October/early November.

The C&AG provided an update on her upcoming review of the Recommendations Tracker and the Committee also noted a commentary on the Health & Social Care Follow-Up Report.

## 5. Public Hearing

The Committee welcomed the Director Generals for Customer and Local Services and Strategic Policy, Planning and Performance to a public hearing regarding Performance Management and the Response to COVID-19. The hearing was recorded, and a transcript produced.

Following the public hearing, the Committee issued a social media release and press release.

### 6. Review of Estate Management

The Committee received an update from Officers regarding the drafting of its report on Estate Management and agreed that the Chair should sign off the final version.

#### 7. Review of Performance Management

The Committee received an update from the Chair regarding its review of Performance Management and agreed to request Officers to produce an Evidence Grid, and to reschedule its upcoming Sub-Group meeting to 1pm on 20th October 2021.

#### 8. Review of COVID-19

The Committee received an update from the Vice-Chair regarding its review of the Government of Jersey's response to COVID-19 and agreed to request private briefings from the 'Track, Test and Test' programme organisers and the Director of Public Health. The Committee further agreed to reschedule its Sub-Group's meeting to 3pm on Wednesday 20th October 2021.

## 10. Next Meeting

The Committee noted that its next meeting will take place at 12 noon on Monday 18th October 2021 in the Blampied Room.

# **Record of Meeting**

Date: 18th October 2021

Present	Deputy Inna Gardiner (Chair) Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone (Vice-Chair) (Item 4 onwards) Connétable John Le Maistre Senator Tracey Vallois Dr Helen Miles Mr Adrian Lane
	Mr Graeme Phipps
Apologies	Connétable Andy Jehan
	Paul van Bodegom
In attendance	Lynn Pamment, Comptroller and Auditor General (C&AG) Caro Tomlinson, Committee and Panel Officer Theodore Stone, Research & Project Officer Edward Le Gallais, Communications Officer
	Item 2 only: Andy Scate, Director General for Infrastructure, Housing and Environment Maria Benbow, Group Director for Commercial Services Ellen Littlechild, Group Director for Operations and Transport

Agenda matter	Action
1. Minutes	
The PAC approved the minutes of its meeting of 4th October 2021.  Conflicts of Interest	
Deputy Gardiner declared an interest as a member of the States of Jersey's Diversity Forum regarding Item 10.	
Private Briefing with the Director General for Infrastructure, Housing and Environment	
The PAC welcomed the Director General for Infrastructure, Housing and Environment to a private briefing on the collapse of nmcn PLC and the future of the Sewage Treatment Works capital project. This briefing was held in private in accordance with the Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011 (as amended) under Qualified Exemption Article 35.	
Following the private briefing, the PAC noted the answers to written questions submitted to the Minister for Infrastructure by the Chair and agreed to draft a letter to the Director General for Infrastructure, Housing and Environment to seek further information regarding the project.	СТ
Appointment of Acting Director General for Children, Young People, Education and Skills	

The PAC noted the appointment of the Group Managing Director for Health and Community Services, Robert Sainsbury, as the Acting Director General for Children, Young People, Education and Skills, commencing 1st January 2022.	
Work Programme	
The PAC noted the updated Work Programme and that Graeme Phipps and Paul van Bodegom (lay members) would join the meeting of 15th November 2021 remotely.	
C&AG Audit Plan	
The Committee received an update from the C&AG on her audit plan for 2021. The Committee noted that the C&AG had issued two further draft reports on the Co-Funded Payroll Scheme and Support to Businesses and Individuals, which would be published in the coming weeks. The Committee also accepted the C&AG's offer for her affiliate to meet with members prior to its public hearing with the Chief Operating Officer on 1st November 2021. The Committee agreed it would benefit from discussing technical aspects of the report on the ITS (Integrated Technology Solution) Cloud programme in advance of the Executive Response to the report which was due on 26 November 2021. The PAC agreed it would want to challenge Government officers on the lack of States-wide IT Strategy and the costs of the ICT project and agreed to consider relevant questions to the Chief Operating Officer and Chief of Staff during its upcoming public hearings on the 1st and 15th November respectively.	
The C&AG advised that she had issued a follow up draft report on Annual Reporting, including a Good Practice guide, and that this would be issued in Q4 2021, and that she had begun fieldwork on the Government of Jersey's Recommendations Tracker and implementation of C&AG recommendations with a report to be issued by the end of 2021.	
7. Review of COVID-19 Response	
The PAC received an update from Officers on the COVID-19 Response and noted the list of stakeholders contacted.	
8. Review of Estate Management	
The PAC noted that the Executive Response to its recently published Report on Estate Management was due on 26 November 2021.	СТ
9. Spend Local	
The PAC noted the Executive Response to its recently published Report on the Government of Jersey's Spend Local Scheme was due on 19 November 2021.	СТ
8. Citizens' Panels	
The PAC received and reviewed draft Heads of Report on the Government of Jersey's use of Citizens' Panels and their organisational processes. The PAC agreed to consider their administration processes, remit, member selection and cost as part of its review. The Committee further agreed to draft letters to the Sortition Foundation, Involve.org, and responsible officers within the Department for Strategic Policy, Planning and Performance, to seek a full breakdown of costs and facilitation processes of the Citizens' groups.  9. States Annual Report and Accounts 2020	
3. States Allitual Report and Accounts 2020	
The PAC reviewed and amended a draft Comments Paper to the Executive Response on the States Annual Report and Accounts 2020 prior to its publication.	

The Committee agreed it would seek a response to those comments from the Chair of the States Employment Board and the Chief Executive Officer by 11th November 2021.  10. Anti-Corruption Arrangements  The PAC noted that the proposed Anti-Corruption Arrangements would be delayed following a request from the Privileges and Procedures Committee's Diversity Forum to receive a briefing from the Deputy Speaker of Quebec regarding the operation of its arrangements. It requested the officer to keep it updated of developments.  CT  11. Performance Management  The PAC reviewed a draft question plan for its public hearing with the Chief of Staff on Monday 15th November 2021 and agreed to include questions regarding the most prominent risks to each department and how they were being resolved.  The PAC agreed to ask at least one question on the Government of Jersey's reporting and monitoring of risk at each future public hearing. It also agreed to request a breakdown of the responsibilities of the former Director of Risk and Audit and how they had been shared between senior officers since his departure, from the Treasurer of the States.  CT  12. Internal Audit Protocol  The PAC received a letter from the Chief Executive Officer dated 15 October 2021, together with a revised Internal Audit Protocol, which detailed the process for requesting Internal Audit reports and updates from the Chief Internal Auditor.  CT  13. Next Meeting  The Committee noted that its next meeting will take place at 12 noon on Monday 1st November 2021 in Le Capelain Room and would include a public hearing with the Chief Operating Officer and Team Jersey at 2pm.		1
November 2021.  10. Anti-Corruption Arrangements  The PAC noted that the proposed Anti-Corruption Arrangements would be delayed following a request from the Privileges and Procedures Committee's Diversity Forum to receive a briefing from the Deputy Speaker of Quebec regarding the operation of its arrangements. It requested the officer to keep it updated of developments.  11. Performance Management  The PAC reviewed a draft question plan for its public hearing with the Chief of Staff on Monday 15th November 2021 and agreed to include questions regarding the most prominent risks to each department and how they were being resolved.  The PAC agreed to ask at least one question on the Government of Jersey's reporting and monitoring of risk at each future public hearing. It also agreed to request a breakdown of the responsibilities of the former Director of Risk and Audit and how they had been shared between senior officers since his departure, from the Treasurer of the States.  12. Internal Audit Protocol  The PAC received a letter from the Chief Executive Officer dated 15 October 2021, together with a revised Internal Audit Protocol, which detailed the process for requesting Internal Audit reports and updates from the Chief Internal Auditor.  13. Next Meeting  The Committee noted that its next meeting will take place at 12 noon on Monday 1st November 2021 in Le Capelain Room and would include a public hearing with		
The PAC noted that the proposed Anti-Corruption Arrangements would be delayed following a request from the Privileges and Procedures Committee's Diversity Forum to receive a briefing from the Deputy Speaker of Quebec regarding the operation of its arrangements. It requested the officer to keep it updated of developments.  11. Performance Management  The PAC reviewed a draft question plan for its public hearing with the Chief of Staff on Monday 15th November 2021 and agreed to include questions regarding the most prominent risks to each department and how they were being resolved.  The PAC agreed to ask at least one question on the Government of Jersey's reporting and monitoring of risk at each future public hearing. It also agreed to request a breakdown of the responsibilities of the former Director of Risk and Audit and how they had been shared between senior officers since his departure, from the Treasurer of the States.  12. Internal Audit Protocol  The PAC received a letter from the Chief Executive Officer dated 15 October 2021, together with a revised Internal Audit Protocol, which detailed the process for requesting Internal Audit reports and updates from the Chief Internal Auditor.  13. Next Meeting  The Committee noted that its next meeting will take place at 12 noon on Monday 1st November 2021 in Le Capelain Room and would include a public hearing with		
The PAC noted that the proposed Anti-Corruption Arrangements would be delayed following a request from the Privileges and Procedures Committee's Diversity Forum to receive a briefing from the Deputy Speaker of Quebec regarding the operation of its arrangements. It requested the officer to keep it updated of developments.  11. Performance Management  The PAC reviewed a draft question plan for its public hearing with the Chief of Staff on Monday 15th November 2021 and agreed to include questions regarding the most prominent risks to each department and how they were being resolved.  The PAC agreed to ask at least one question on the Government of Jersey's reporting and monitoring of risk at each future public hearing. It also agreed to request a breakdown of the responsibilities of the former Director of Risk and Audit and how they had been shared between senior officers since his departure, from the Treasurer of the States.  12. Internal Audit Protocol  The PAC received a letter from the Chief Executive Officer dated 15 October 2021, together with a revised Internal Audit Protocol, which detailed the process for requesting Internal Audit reports and updates from the Chief Internal Auditor.  CT  13. Next Meeting  The Committee noted that its next meeting will take place at 12 noon on Monday 1st November 2021 in Le Capelain Room and would include a public hearing with	November 2021.	СТ
following a request from the Privileges and Procedures Committee's Diversity Forum to receive a briefing from the Deputy Speaker of Quebec regarding the operation of its arrangements. It requested the officer to keep it updated of developments.  11. Performance Management  The PAC reviewed a draft question plan for its public hearing with the Chief of Staff on Monday 15th November 2021 and agreed to include questions regarding the most prominent risks to each department and how they were being resolved.  The PAC agreed to ask at least one question on the Government of Jersey's reporting and monitoring of risk at each future public hearing. It also agreed to request a breakdown of the responsibilities of the former Director of Risk and Audit and how they had been shared between senior officers since his departure, from the Treasurer of the States.  CT  12. Internal Audit Protocol  The PAC received a letter from the Chief Executive Officer dated 15 October 2021, together with a revised Internal Audit Protocol, which detailed the process for requesting Internal Audit reports and updates from the Chief Internal Auditor.  CT  13. Next Meeting  The Committee noted that its next meeting will take place at 12 noon on Monday 1st November 2021 in Le Capelain Room and would include a public hearing with	10. Anti-Corruption Arrangements	
following a request from the Privileges and Procedures Committee's Diversity Forum to receive a briefing from the Deputy Speaker of Quebec regarding the operation of its arrangements. It requested the officer to keep it updated of developments.  11. Performance Management  The PAC reviewed a draft question plan for its public hearing with the Chief of Staff on Monday 15th November 2021 and agreed to include questions regarding the most prominent risks to each department and how they were being resolved.  The PAC agreed to ask at least one question on the Government of Jersey's reporting and monitoring of risk at each future public hearing. It also agreed to request a breakdown of the responsibilities of the former Director of Risk and Audit and how they had been shared between senior officers since his departure, from the Treasurer of the States.  CT  12. Internal Audit Protocol  The PAC received a letter from the Chief Executive Officer dated 15 October 2021, together with a revised Internal Audit Protocol, which detailed the process for requesting Internal Audit reports and updates from the Chief Internal Auditor.  CT  13. Next Meeting  The Committee noted that its next meeting will take place at 12 noon on Monday 1st November 2021 in Le Capelain Room and would include a public hearing with		
Forum to receive a briefing from the Deputy Speaker of Quebec regarding the operation of its arrangements. It requested the officer to keep it updated of developments.  11. Performance Management  The PAC reviewed a draft question plan for its public hearing with the Chief of Staff on Monday 15th November 2021 and agreed to include questions regarding the most prominent risks to each department and how they were being resolved.  The PAC agreed to ask at least one question on the Government of Jersey's reporting and monitoring of risk at each future public hearing. It also agreed to request a breakdown of the responsibilities of the former Director of Risk and Audit and how they had been shared between senior officers since his departure, from the Treasurer of the States.  12. Internal Audit Protocol  The PAC received a letter from the Chief Executive Officer dated 15 October 2021, together with a revised Internal Audit Protocol, which detailed the process for requesting Internal Audit reports and updates from the Chief Internal Auditor.  13. Next Meeting  The Committee noted that its next meeting will take place at 12 noon on Monday 1st November 2021 in Le Capelain Room and would include a public hearing with	The PAC noted that the proposed Anti-Corruption Arrangements would be delayed	
operation of its arrangements. It requested the officer to keep it updated of developments.  11. Performance Management  The PAC reviewed a draft question plan for its public hearing with the Chief of Staff on Monday 15th November 2021 and agreed to include questions regarding the most prominent risks to each department and how they were being resolved.  The PAC agreed to ask at least one question on the Government of Jersey's reporting and monitoring of risk at each future public hearing. It also agreed to request a breakdown of the responsibilities of the former Director of Risk and Audit and how they had been shared between senior officers since his departure, from the Treasurer of the States.  CT  12. Internal Audit Protocol  The PAC received a letter from the Chief Executive Officer dated 15 October 2021, together with a revised Internal Audit Protocol, which detailed the process for requesting Internal Audit reports and updates from the Chief Internal Auditor.  CT  13. Next Meeting  The Committee noted that its next meeting will take place at 12 noon on Monday 1st November 2021 in Le Capelain Room and would include a public hearing with		
developments.  11. Performance Management  The PAC reviewed a draft question plan for its public hearing with the Chief of Staff on Monday 15th November 2021 and agreed to include questions regarding the most prominent risks to each department and how they were being resolved.  The PAC agreed to ask at least one question on the Government of Jersey's reporting and monitoring of risk at each future public hearing. It also agreed to request a breakdown of the responsibilities of the former Director of Risk and Audit and how they had been shared between senior officers since his departure, from the Treasurer of the States.  12. Internal Audit Protocol  The PAC received a letter from the Chief Executive Officer dated 15 October 2021, together with a revised Internal Audit Protocol, which detailed the process for requesting Internal Audit reports and updates from the Chief Internal Auditor.  13. Next Meeting  The Committee noted that its next meeting will take place at 12 noon on Monday 1st November 2021 in Le Capelain Room and would include a public hearing with		
The PAC reviewed a draft question plan for its public hearing with the Chief of Staff on Monday 15th November 2021 and agreed to include questions regarding the most prominent risks to each department and how they were being resolved.  The PAC agreed to ask at least one question on the Government of Jersey's reporting and monitoring of risk at each future public hearing. It also agreed to request a breakdown of the responsibilities of the former Director of Risk and Audit and how they had been shared between senior officers since his departure, from the Treasurer of the States.  CT  12. Internal Audit Protocol  The PAC received a letter from the Chief Executive Officer dated 15 October 2021, together with a revised Internal Audit Protocol, which detailed the process for requesting Internal Audit reports and updates from the Chief Internal Auditor.  CT  13. Next Meeting  The Committee noted that its next meeting will take place at 12 noon on Monday 1st November 2021 in Le Capelain Room and would include a public hearing with	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	
The PAC reviewed a draft question plan for its public hearing with the Chief of Staff on Monday 15th November 2021 and agreed to include questions regarding the most prominent risks to each department and how they were being resolved.  The PAC agreed to ask at least one question on the Government of Jersey's reporting and monitoring of risk at each future public hearing. It also agreed to request a breakdown of the responsibilities of the former Director of Risk and Audit and how they had been shared between senior officers since his departure, from the Treasurer of the States.  CT  12. Internal Audit Protocol  The PAC received a letter from the Chief Executive Officer dated 15 October 2021, together with a revised Internal Audit Protocol, which detailed the process for requesting Internal Audit reports and updates from the Chief Internal Auditor.  CT  13. Next Meeting  The Committee noted that its next meeting will take place at 12 noon on Monday 1st November 2021 in Le Capelain Room and would include a public hearing with	developments.	CT
on Monday 15th November 2021 and agreed to include questions regarding the most prominent risks to each department and how they were being resolved.  The PAC agreed to ask at least one question on the Government of Jersey's reporting and monitoring of risk at each future public hearing. It also agreed to request a breakdown of the responsibilities of the former Director of Risk and Audit and how they had been shared between senior officers since his departure, from the Treasurer of the States.  CT  12. Internal Audit Protocol  The PAC received a letter from the Chief Executive Officer dated 15 October 2021, together with a revised Internal Audit Protocol, which detailed the process for requesting Internal Audit reports and updates from the Chief Internal Auditor.  CT  13. Next Meeting  The Committee noted that its next meeting will take place at 12 noon on Monday 1st November 2021 in Le Capelain Room and would include a public hearing with	11. Performance Management	
on Monday 15th November 2021 and agreed to include questions regarding the most prominent risks to each department and how they were being resolved.  The PAC agreed to ask at least one question on the Government of Jersey's reporting and monitoring of risk at each future public hearing. It also agreed to request a breakdown of the responsibilities of the former Director of Risk and Audit and how they had been shared between senior officers since his departure, from the Treasurer of the States.  CT  12. Internal Audit Protocol  The PAC received a letter from the Chief Executive Officer dated 15 October 2021, together with a revised Internal Audit Protocol, which detailed the process for requesting Internal Audit reports and updates from the Chief Internal Auditor.  CT  13. Next Meeting  The Committee noted that its next meeting will take place at 12 noon on Monday 1st November 2021 in Le Capelain Room and would include a public hearing with	The PAC reviewed a draft question plan for its public hearing with the Chief of Staff	
most prominent risks to each department and how they were being resolved.  The PAC agreed to ask at least one question on the Government of Jersey's reporting and monitoring of risk at each future public hearing. It also agreed to request a breakdown of the responsibilities of the former Director of Risk and Audit and how they had been shared between senior officers since his departure, from the Treasurer of the States.  CT  12. Internal Audit Protocol  The PAC received a letter from the Chief Executive Officer dated 15 October 2021, together with a revised Internal Audit Protocol, which detailed the process for requesting Internal Audit reports and updates from the Chief Internal Auditor.  CT  13. Next Meeting  The Committee noted that its next meeting will take place at 12 noon on Monday 1st November 2021 in Le Capelain Room and would include a public hearing with		
The PAC agreed to ask at least one question on the Government of Jersey's reporting and monitoring of risk at each future public hearing. It also agreed to request a breakdown of the responsibilities of the former Director of Risk and Audit and how they had been shared between senior officers since his departure, from the Treasurer of the States.  12. Internal Audit Protocol  The PAC received a letter from the Chief Executive Officer dated 15 October 2021, together with a revised Internal Audit Protocol, which detailed the process for requesting Internal Audit reports and updates from the Chief Internal Auditor.  13. Next Meeting  The Committee noted that its next meeting will take place at 12 noon on Monday 1st November 2021 in Le Capelain Room and would include a public hearing with		
reporting and monitoring of risk at each future public hearing. It also agreed to request a breakdown of the responsibilities of the former Director of Risk and Audit and how they had been shared between senior officers since his departure, from the Treasurer of the States.  12. Internal Audit Protocol  The PAC received a letter from the Chief Executive Officer dated 15 October 2021, together with a revised Internal Audit Protocol, which detailed the process for requesting Internal Audit reports and updates from the Chief Internal Auditor.  13. Next Meeting  The Committee noted that its next meeting will take place at 12 noon on Monday 1st November 2021 in Le Capelain Room and would include a public hearing with		
reporting and monitoring of risk at each future public hearing. It also agreed to request a breakdown of the responsibilities of the former Director of Risk and Audit and how they had been shared between senior officers since his departure, from the Treasurer of the States.  12. Internal Audit Protocol  The PAC received a letter from the Chief Executive Officer dated 15 October 2021, together with a revised Internal Audit Protocol, which detailed the process for requesting Internal Audit reports and updates from the Chief Internal Auditor.  13. Next Meeting  The Committee noted that its next meeting will take place at 12 noon on Monday 1st November 2021 in Le Capelain Room and would include a public hearing with	The PAC agreed to ask at least one question on the Government of Jersey's	
request a breakdown of the responsibilities of the former Director of Risk and Audit and how they had been shared between senior officers since his departure, from the Treasurer of the States.  12. Internal Audit Protocol  The PAC received a letter from the Chief Executive Officer dated 15 October 2021, together with a revised Internal Audit Protocol, which detailed the process for requesting Internal Audit reports and updates from the Chief Internal Auditor.  13. Next Meeting  The Committee noted that its next meeting will take place at 12 noon on Monday 1st November 2021 in Le Capelain Room and would include a public hearing with		
and how they had been shared between senior officers since his departure, from the Treasurer of the States.  12. Internal Audit Protocol  The PAC received a letter from the Chief Executive Officer dated 15 October 2021, together with a revised Internal Audit Protocol, which detailed the process for requesting Internal Audit reports and updates from the Chief Internal Auditor.  13. Next Meeting  The Committee noted that its next meeting will take place at 12 noon on Monday 1st November 2021 in Le Capelain Room and would include a public hearing with	request a breakdown of the responsibilities of the former Director of Risk and Audit	
the Treasurer of the States.  12. Internal Audit Protocol  The PAC received a letter from the Chief Executive Officer dated 15 October 2021, together with a revised Internal Audit Protocol, which detailed the process for requesting Internal Audit reports and updates from the Chief Internal Auditor.  13. Next Meeting  The Committee noted that its next meeting will take place at 12 noon on Monday 1st November 2021 in Le Capelain Room and would include a public hearing with	and how they had been shared between senior officers since his departure, from	
The PAC received a letter from the Chief Executive Officer dated 15 October 2021, together with a revised Internal Audit Protocol, which detailed the process for requesting Internal Audit reports and updates from the Chief Internal Auditor.  13. Next Meeting  The Committee noted that its next meeting will take place at 12 noon on Monday 1st November 2021 in Le Capelain Room and would include a public hearing with		CT
together with a revised Internal Audit Protocol, which detailed the process for requesting Internal Audit reports and updates from the Chief Internal Auditor.  13. Next Meeting  The Committee noted that its next meeting will take place at 12 noon on Monday 1st November 2021 in Le Capelain Room and would include a public hearing with	12. Internal Audit Protocol	
together with a revised Internal Audit Protocol, which detailed the process for requesting Internal Audit reports and updates from the Chief Internal Auditor.  13. Next Meeting  The Committee noted that its next meeting will take place at 12 noon on Monday 1st November 2021 in Le Capelain Room and would include a public hearing with	The PAC received a letter from the Chief Executive Officer dated 15 October 2021	
requesting Internal Audit reports and updates from the Chief Internal Auditor.  13. Next Meeting  The Committee noted that its next meeting will take place at 12 noon on Monday 1st November 2021 in Le Capelain Room and would include a public hearing with	,	
13. Next Meeting  The Committee noted that its next meeting will take place at 12 noon on Monday 1st November 2021 in Le Capelain Room and would include a public hearing with		СТ
1st November 2021 in Le Capelain Room and would include a public hearing with		
1st November 2021 in Le Capelain Room and would include a public hearing with		
·	The Committee noted that its next meeting will take place at 12 noon on Monday	
the Chief Operating Officer and Team Jersey at 2pm.	1st November 2021 in Le Capelain Room and would include a public hearing with	
	the Chief Operating Officer and Team Jersey at 2pm.	

# **Record of Meeting**

Date: 1st November 2021

Present	Deputy Inna Gardiner (Chair) Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone (Vice-Chair) Senator Tracey Vallois (Items 1-6 only) Dr Helen Miles Mr Adrian Lane Mr Graeme Phipps Mr Paul van Bodegom
Apologies	Connétable Andy Jehan Connétable John Le Maistre
In attendance	Lynn Pamment, Comptroller and Auditor General (C&AG) Ant Harrison, C&AG Affiliate on IT Kellie Boydens, Principal Committee and Panel Officer (Items 1-4, 6-13 only) Katie Griffiths, Committee and Panel Officer (Items 5-13 only) Theodore Stone, Research & Project Officer Edward Le Gallais, Communications Officer (Items 5-13 only)  Item 5 only: John Quinn, Chief Operating Officer Mark Grimley, Group Director, People and Corporate Services Gary Bowles, Group Director, Modernisation and Digital Maria Benbow, Group Director, Commercial Services Denise Drieu, Programme Director, Team Jersey Joanna Spybey, Head of Business Support

Agenda matter	Action
1. Minutes	
The PAC approved the minutes of its meeting of 18th October. The PAC agreed to amend the public minutes to note Dr Helen Miles' membership of the Citizens' Jury Advisory Panel on Assisted Dying for Item 8 and the Vice-Chair and Senator Vallois' membership of the Diversity Forum on Item 10.	
2. C&AG Audit Plan	
The PAC received an update from the C&AG in respect of her Audit Plan, including the issuance of her report on the ITS Programme. The C&AG outlined that work was ongoing on the Recommendations Tracker and Cybersecurity, with plans to issue a report on the Recommendations Tracker in December 2021.	
The PAC welcomed Ant Harrison, the C&AG's Affiliate on IT, and received a presentation regarding the potential risks and benefits of the Government of Jersey's use of Cloud-Based Computing and what questions the PAC should be asking regarding its implementation. The PAC agreed to include these questions in written form to the Chief Operating Officer following its public hearing.	
3. Integrated Technology Solution	

The PAC agreed to consider undertaking a short review on the Government of Jersey's implementation of the Integrated Technology Solution (ITS) based on the work of the C&AG. The C&AG recommended that the PAC examine the delivery of the Government of Jersey's IT strategy and whether it was fit for purpose. The PAC further agreed to consider including reference to ITS in its legacy report, so that the next PAC would be able to reflect on the strategy once it had been delivered.

#### 4. Recommendations Tracker

The PAC agreed to request a full copy of Health and Community Services' departmental recommendations tracker, and to ask for specific recommendations to be updated according to their current Red, Amber, Green implementation status.

### 5. Public Hearing with the Chief Operating Officer and Team Jersey

The PAC welcomed the Chief Operating Officer and Team Jersey to a public hearing. The hearing was recorded, and a transcript provided. Following the Public Hearing, the PAC agreed to follow-up its questions and submit a series of written questions to the Chief Operating Officer.

The PAC agreed to draft a press notice outlining its key findings from the public hearing, which would be circulated to the Chair for final approval.

The Committee also agreed to invite the Group Director for Commercial Services to the PAC's public hearing with the Treasurer of the States scheduled for 17th January 2022, and to invite the Group Director for People and Corporate Services to a private briefing on performance management.

## 6. Governance Arrangements on Healthcare Follow-Up

The PAC considered a comments paper on the Executive Response to the C&AG Follow-Up Report on the Governance Arrangements on Health Care and agreed to provide any final comments by Wednesday 3rd November 2021 before publishing.

### 7. Citizens' Panels

The PAC received draft letters to the Director General for Strategic Policy, Planning and Performance and other stakeholders regarding the Government of Jersey's use of Citizens' Panels, Assemblies and Juries. The PAG agreed to provide any final comments by Wednesday 3rd November 2021.

#### 8. COVID-19 Response

The PAC received a verbal update form Officers regarding the PAC's review of the Government of Jersey's Response to COVID-19.

#### 9. Estate Management

The PAC noted that the Executive Response to the PAC's report was due on 26 November 2021.

## 10. States Annual Report and Accounts 2020

The PAC noted that its Comments Paper on the Executive Response to the States Annual Report and Accounts 2020 was published on 21st October 2021, with responses to the letters to the Chair of SEB and the CEO due on 11th November 2021.

### 11. Automatic Electoral Registration Project (R.164/2021)

The PAC received a briefing paper on the Automatic Electoral Registration Project and agreed to consider further actions in private.	
12. PAC Training	
The PAC noted that its next training session with Bespoke Training would take place in person at 12pm on Friday 26th November 2021.	
13. Next Meeting	
The Committee noted that its next meeting will take place at 12:00pm on Monday	
15th November 2021 in the Le Capelain Room and would include a public hearing	
with the Chief of Staff at 2pm and a further public hearing with the Interim Director	
General for the Economy at 4pm.	

# **Record of Meeting**

Date: 15th November 2021

Present	Deputy Inna Gardiner (Chair) Senator Tracey Vallois Connétable Andy Jehan Connétable John Le Maistre (joined online) Dr Helen Miles Mr Adrian Lane Mr Graeme Phipps (joined online)
	Mr Paul van Bodegom
Apologies	Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone (Vice-Chair)
In attendance	Lynn Pamment, Comptroller and Auditor General (C&AG) Anna Thorne, Committee & Panel Officer (Items 1 – 9 only) Theodore Stone, Research & Project Officer Edward Le Gallais, Communications Officer (Items 10 - 15 only)
	Item 10 only: Catherine Madden, Chief of Staff
	Item 12 only:
	Richard Corrigan, Director General for the Economy

Agenda matter	
1. Minutes	
The PAC approved the minutes of its meeting of 1st November 2021.	
2. Work Programme	TS
The PAC noted its updated work programme and agreed to consider a report the Government of Jersey's Integrated Technology Solution and to consider stakeholders for this review.	
3. Declaration of Conflicts	
The Connétable of St. John informed the PAC that he was a former Chair of Jer Business.	sey
4. C&AG Audit Plan	TS
The PAC received an update from the C&AG on her audit plan and her Anr Reporting report. The C&AG confirmed that she would issue further reports Government support provided to businesses in response to COVID-19 and presher findings to the PAC at its meeting on 29th November 2021.	on
The C&AG advised that she had recently attended the European Organisation Regional External Public Finance Audit Institutions in Sarajevo and confirmed she would provide a presentation to the PAC on the work of other public audit in Europe to provide comparative information in respect of the PAC's review of Government of Jersey's Response to COVID-19.	that tors

The PAC received a project specification of the C&AG's review of Test and Trace and the vaccine rollout. The C&AG also highlighted her report on Annual Reporting and its associated Good Practice Guide and informed the PAC that she would extend invitations to her workshops on the 15th December 2021 on improving good reporting practices.

The C&AG identified culture and resources as two key areas of concern and confirmed that her office was in the process of engaging organisations approaching the Jersey Audit Office upon request and noted considerations from the C&AG regarding the provision of advice and support to organisations on annual reporting.

The C&AG further confirmed that she would be issuing her draft report on the Recommendations Tracker in the week commencing 15th November 2021, with the final report to be published in December 2021.

The PAC considered the number of Arm's Length Organisations and the financial implications of preparing each annual report, with the C&AG confirming her intention to further consider each body once the Arm's Length Body Oversight Board began to operate.

The PAC agreed to the C&AG's recommendation to consider and challenge the executive response to be provided by the Government of Jersey and agreed to further consider her work during the next meeting of the Performance Management subgroup, and to consider any sustainability reporting produced.

The PAC agreed to question the Government of Jersey about the collation of understanding of Ministerial and officer-based responsibilities to Arms' Length Bodies and similar organisations, and to consider the Government of Jersey's reporting on sustainability.

## 5. Executive Responses to C&AG and PAC Reports

The PAC noted that the Executive Responses to the C&AG's reports on the ICT Cloud Project and Annual Reporting would be provided on 26th November and 10th December 2021 respectively, and further noted that the Executive Response to the PAC's review of Estate Management would be received on Friday 26th November 2021. The PAC approved the heads of report to the Executive Response to the C&AG's Report on the ICT Cloud Project.

Having further recalled the questions of the Chief Operating Officer about the ICTS project and the delay of the Automated Voter Registration programme at its public hearing of 1st November 2021, it agreed to hear from the AVR project lead before incorporating findings into its report.

#### 6. States Annual Report and Accounts

The PAC noted responses from the Chair of the States Employment Board and the interim Chief Executive Officer to its Comments Paper on the Executive Response to the States Annual Report and Accounts 2020. It agreed to incorporate its recommendations to improve States Annual Reporting in its Legacy Report, to be published April 2022.

#### 7. Estate Management

TS

TS

TS

The PAC noted that the Executive Response to the PAC's report was due on 26th November 2021 and agreed it should consider a draft Comments paper at its next TS 8. Performance Management The PAC noted a draft letter to the interim Chief Executive regarding Target Operating Models and agreed to include additional questions on the establishment of project governance to achieve the targets outlined in the Target Operating Model, how changes to the scope of delivery have been governed, and how previous, current and future Target Operating Models align. 9. Automatic Voter Registration (R.164/2021) TS The PAC agreed to schedule a private briefing with the Greffier of the States at 2:30pm on Wednesday 1st December 2021 to discuss his role in the Automatic Voter Registration project. 10. Public Hearing with the Chief of Staff TS The PAC welcomed the Chief of Staff to a public hearing on the Recommendations Tracker. The meeting was recorded, and a transcript was provided. Following the hearing, the PAC agreed to submit a series of written, follow-up questions to the Chief of Staff, requesting: Copies of the report created on recommendations implemented through the C&AG's reporting on COVID-19; A breakdown on the recommendations and risks marked within the Recommendations Tracker as 'Red': Updates to the Finance Law Manual implemented from Recommendations; The Framework for Stakeholder Engagement; and The number of new staff employed, alongside the number of employees under the Chief of Staff and details on each of their roles. 11. Public Hearing with the Director Generals for Health & Community TS Services and Children, Young People, Education and Skills The PAC discussed its upcoming public hearing on 29th November 2021 and agreed to include questions on departmental responsibilities between the two departments, including mental health and social care and the decision to include those functions in the department for Children, Young People, Education and Skills. The PAC agreed to request plans for future departmental collaboration, the work programme of the interim Director General, and examples of collaborative working. monitoring of performance and accountability between the two departments, including accountability from independent governing authorities. The PAC further agreed to question the Director Generals on the response to COVID-19 and how both departments collaborated to deliver services to respond to the pandemic. The PAC also determined to consider the provision of support for early years support and intervention and how this is represented in performance management

with reference to the submissions received by the PAC for its reviews of

Performance Management and the Response to COVID-19.

## 12. Public Hearing with the Director General for the Economy

The PAC welcomed the Director General for the Economy to a public hearing on the formation of the new department. The meeting was recorded, and a transcript was provided.

#### 13. Citizens' Panels

The PAC noted that responses to its letters to the Director General for Strategic Policy, Planning and Performance and other stakeholders regarding the Government of Jersey's use of Citizens' Panels, Assemblies and Juries, would be received by 3rd December 2021.

### 14. COVID-19 Response Review

TS

The PAC noted the next meetings of the subgroup:

- a. 25th November 2021 at 2pm, including a private briefing from the CEO of Headway.
- b. 9th December 1pm-2pm including a private briefing (to be confirmed).

### 13. Next Meeting

TS

The PAC noted that its next meeting would be at 12:00pm on Monday 29th November 2021 and would include a joint public hearing with the Director Generals for CYPES and HCS at 2:00pm. The Committee agreed to consider objectives for the upcoming public hearing and questions for inclusion, focusing on Performance Management of both departments and the Covid-19 response, especially how it had impacted vulnerable groups.

The PAC further noted that its Performance Management and COVID-19 subgroups would meet on 1st December 2021, with a private briefing with the Greffier of the States at 2:30pm

The PAC agreed to reschedule its meeting on Monday 13th December 2021 to Thursday 9th December 2021 at 2:00pm.

# **Record of Meeting**

Date: 1st December 2021

Present	Deputy Inna Gardiner (Chair) Connétable John Le Maistre Connétable Andy Jehan
	Dr Helen Miles Mr Adrian Lane Mr Graeme Phipps
	Mr Paul van Bodegom
Apologies	Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone (Vice-Chair) Senator Tracey Vallois
In attendance	Theo Stone, Research and Project Officer Kellie Boydens, Principal Committee and Panel Officer Caro Tomlinson, Committee and Panel Officer Lynn Pamment, Comptroller and Auditor General, C&AG
	Mark Egan, Greffier of the States

Agenda matter	
Private Briefing from the Greffier of the States on the Automatic Electoral Register (R.176/2021)	
The Committee welcomed the Greffier of the States to a private briefing on the Automatic Electoral Register. This briefing was held in private in accordance with the Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011 (as amended) under Qualified Exemption Article 35.	
Following the private briefing, the PAC agreed to draft a letter to the Greffier to establish a clear, public understanding of the item in question.	

# **Record of Meeting**

Date: 9th December 2021

Present	Deputy Inna Gardiner (Chair) Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone (Vice-Chair) Connétable John Le Maistre Connétable Andy Jehan Senator Tracey Vallois Dr Helen Miles
	Mr Adrian Lane Mr Graeme Phipps Mr Paul van Bodegom
In attendance	Theo Stone, Research and Project Officer Caro Tomlinson, Committee and Panel Officer Lynn Pamment, Comptroller and Auditor General, C&AG

Agenda matter	Action
1. Minutes	
The PAC approved its minutes of the 29th November and 1st December 2021.  2. Work Programme	
The PAC received an updated work programme until the end of its term in May 2022. The PAC agreed to invite the Director General for Health and Community Services to a public hearing on the Response to the COVID-19 Pandemic on 7th February 2022.	
The PAC further noted that the last working day for the Interim Chief Executive would be on 31st January 2021 and agreed to request Officers to seek an understanding of the handover arrangements between the Interim Chief Executive and his successor.	
3. Audit Plan Update	
The PAC received an update from the C&AG in respect of her Audit Plan and Strategy until 2025 and received a presentation on her upcoming report on the upcoming report on the Government of Jersey's use of the Recommendations Tracker in respect of C&AG Recommendations.	
The PAC asked whether the Government of Jersey had presented itself with sufficient time to implement the C&AG's recommendations, how recommendations could be continued to be acted upon to ensure implementation, and how departmental best practices could be used to share learning and corporate approaches.	
The C&AG noted that the PAC was able to challenge the Government of Jersey when recommendations had not been implemented and highlighted the way it had responded to the Executive Response to the C&AG's report on Health and Social Care as a successful example. The C&AG further noted that there was an	

opportunity for the new Chief Executive to set a more disciplined tone in responding to recommendations, and that the current Chief Executive had a lest interventionist approach to the implementation of recommendations than his successor.

The C&AG confirmed that the Government of Jersey's governance team was continuing to develop new roles to improve shared departmental learnings and corporate approaches and noted concerns regarding optimism bias in the Government of Jersey's approach to successfully implemented recommendations and highlighted the need to continue to challenge implemented recommendations. The C&AG confirmed her satisfaction with the escalation but noted that there was still room to improve.

The C&AG confirmed to the PAC that her Audit Plan would include consideration of Social Security Funds, and that the need to follow up on recommendations required a strategy to be implemented with coherent audit assurance and recommended that the PAC consider this as part of its response to the Executive Response on Estate Management.

The C&AG noted that a planned review of Children and Audit Mental Health Services had been moved from 2024 to 2022 following risks highlighted through other reporting outlets. The C&AG confirmed that her Audit Strategy would be published in January 2022.

## 4. Estate Management

The PAC discussed key themes for a comments paper in response to the Executive Response to its Estate Management Report. The PAC agreed to include questions on the Arm's Length Body Oversight Board in its public hearing with the Treasurer of the States on 17th January 2022 and seek information on checks made to spending on structural transformation by the Government of Jersey. The PAC agreed to submit comments and questions on the Executive Response by Monday 13th December 2021.

### 5. Performance Management

The PAC received a summary of the evidence it had received to date as prepared by Officers and discussed, edited and approved a revised draft letter to the Chief Executive regarding Target Operating Models.

#### 6. Response to COVID-19

The PAC received an update from its Vice-Chair on the progress of the Review of the Government of Jersey's Response to COVID-19 and noted that a summary of the evidence it had received would be created by Officers in time for its meeting on 12th January 2022.

#### 7. Citizens' Panels

The PAC received a summary of the evidence it had received to date on the Government of Jersey's use of Citizens' Panels and agreed to request further clarification on the total costs for each body, the increase of facilitation costs, and to seek an understanding of why the Care Inquiry Citizens' Panel's activity was extended beyond its first phase of operation.

## 8. Next Meetings

The PAC noted that its next meetings would take place as follows:

- The next meeting of the COVID-19 Review Subgroup will be held remotely on Microsoft Teams at 2pm on Wednesday 12th January 2022 and would include a private briefing with the Independent Adviser to the Scientific and Technical Advisory Cell (STAC);
- The next meeting of the Performance Management Review Subgroup would be held remotely on Microsoft Teams at 15:30pm on Wednesday 12th January 2022; and
- The next formal meeting of the PAC would be at 12pm on Monday 17th January 2022 in the Blampied Room and would include a public hearing with the Treasurer of the States at 2pm in the States Chamber, subject to future updates to the COVID-19 Guidelines.